

HOW THE KOCHS HAVE ATTACKED POPE FRANCIS WHILE PUSHING A SELF-ENRICHING AGENDA THAT'S ON THE WRONG SIDE OF THE HOLY FATHER



KOCHS AND POPE FRANCIS

The Koch brothers are terrified of the pope's teachings because they threaten what they worship most, their bank accounts. Ever since Pope Francis signaled that he would be issuing an encyclical definitively stating that climate change is man-made and calling for swift action, the Koch network has been trying to get ahead of the narrative. This week, during Pope Francis' visit to the United States, just how far the Koch's self-enriching agenda is on the wrong side of the pope's teachings will be on full display.

Since his election to the papacy, Pope Francis has pleaded for his followers to reject the "trickle-down" policies advocated by the Koch brothers and their political network, saying that it "expresses a crude and naïve trust in the goodness of those wielding economic power." The pope's push against the "invisible hand of the market" has spurred Koch groups like the Cato Institute, the LIBRE Initiative, and Americans for Prosperity to combat the pontiff's statements with their own rhetoric. From espousing the positive effects of "entrepreneurial American capitalism" to arguing that CO₂ emissions "reduce poverty in developing nations," the Koch network tried to get ahead of the narrative that "the kind of unregulated capitalism that the Kochs promote runs counter to church teaching."

In response to the pope's environmental encyclical, which called climate change "one of the principal challenges facing humanity in our day," the Koch-funded Heartland Institute became "the headquarters for the U.S.-based opposition to Pope Francis' climate change plans." Heartland sent a team of scientists to Rome before the encyclical was released "to inform Pope Francis of the truth about climate science," and has since joined a coalition "challenging the Pope's view on global warming and the nature of capitalism." Ahead of the pope's U.S. visit, Heartland has equated his environmental views with pagan "nature worship" and a "rejection of Judeo-Christianity's illustrious tradition of scientific inquiry."

The Koch brothers have also supported organizations and candidates whose immigration policies run counter to the pope's push to make immigration a "hallmark of our society." A number of Koch-funded Catholic Republican presidential candidates have opposed a path to citizenship, and the LIBRE Initiative's national spokesperson, Rachel Campos-Duffy, has called on the pope to address the "immigration and assimilation problem" during his visit to the U.S. Campos-Duffy, who will be at the White House during the pope's welcoming ceremony, has argued that – contrary to the Church's tenet of papal infallibility – Catholics can "respectfully disagree" with the pope, especially on issues of "prudential judgement."

The Koch Brothers And Pope Francis Have Vastly Different Worldviews

POPE FRANCIS HAS CRITICIZED LIBERTARIAN AND CAPITALIST IDEOLOGIES AS ANTI-CATHOLIC AND INHUMANE

On The Economy & The Free Market Ideology

Francis: Corporations, Loan Agencies, Free Trade Treaties, Austerity Measures, And The "Monopolizing Of The Communications Media" Amounts To A New Form Of Colonialism. According to CNN, "Speaking to grassroots organizers in Bolivia, the Pope urged the poor and disenfranchised to rise up against 'new colonialism,' including corporations, loan agencies, free trade treaties, austerity measures, and 'the monopolizing of the communications media." [CNN, 7/11/15]

Pope Francis: "Working For A Just Distribution Of The Fruits Of The Earth And Human Labor" Is A "Moral Obligation," Especially For Christians; "It Is Not Enough To Let A Few Drops Fall Whenever The Poor Shake A Cup." According to CNN, "Pope Francis delivered a fiery denunciation of modern capitalism on Thursday night, calling the 'unfettered pursuit of money' the 'dung of the devil' and accusing world leaders of 'cowardice' for refusing to defend the earth from exploitation. [...] Here are the 7 most pungent quotes from the Pope's speech: [...] 3. 'Working for a just distribution of the fruits of the earth and human labor is not mere philanthropy. It is a moral obligation. For Christians, the responsibility is even greater: it is a commandment.' 4. 'It is not enough to let a few drops fall whenever the poor shake a cup which never runs over by itself."' [CNN, 7/11/15]

Francis: "Some Circles" Use "Popular And Non-Technical Terms" To Argue That Market Growth Will Solve Global Hunger And Poverty, And Show No Interest In "More Balanced Levels Of Production" Or "A Better Distribution Of Wealth." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Some circles maintain that current economics and technology will

solve all environmental problems, and argue, in popular and non-technical terms, that the problems of global hunger and poverty will be resolved simply by market growth. They are less concerned with certain economic theories which today scarcely anybody dares defend, than with their actual operation in the functioning of the economy. They may not affirm such theories with words, but nonetheless support them with their deeds by showing no interest in more balanced levels of production, a better distribution of wealth, concern for the environment and the rights of future generations." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

• Francis: "By Itself The Market Cannot Guarantee Integral Human Development And Social Inclusion." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Some circles maintain that current economics and technology will solve all environmental problems, and argue, in popular and non-technical terms, that the problems of global hunger and poverty will be resolved simply by market growth. [...] Yet by itself the market cannot guarantee integral human development and social inclusion." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

Francis: "Politics Must Not Be Subject To The Economy, Nor Should The Economy Be Subject To The Dictates Of An Efficiency-Driven Paradigm Of Technocracy." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Politics must not be subject to the economy, nor should the economy be subject to the dictates of an efficiency-driven paradigm of technocracy. Today, in view of the common good, there is urgent need for politics and economics to enter into a frank dialogue in the service of life, especially human life." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

Francis: We Can't Trust "Unseen Forces And The Invisible Hand Of The Market;" Growth In Justice Requires "Decisions, Programmes, Mechanisms, And Processes" Geared For "A Better Distribution Of Income." According to Evangelii Gaudium by Pope Francis, "We can no longer trust in the unseen forces and the invisible hand of the market. Growth in justice requires more than economic growth, while presupposing such growth: it requires decisions, programmes, mechanisms and processes specifically geared to a better distribution of income, the creation of sources of employment and an integral promotion of the poor which goes beyond a simple welfare mentality." [Pope Francis – Evangelii Gaudium, 11/24/13]

Francis: Income Inequality Is "The Result Of Ideologies Which Defend The Absolute Autonomy Of The Marketplace And Financial Speculation." According to Evangelii Gaudium by Pope Francis, "While the earnings of a minority are growing exponentially, so too is the gap separating the majority from the prosperity enjoyed by those happy few. This imbalance is the result of ideologies which defend the absolute autonomy of the marketplace and financial speculation." [Pope Francis – Evangelii Gaudium, 11/24/13]

Religion News Service: "Many Catholics – Including Pope Francis – Say The Kind of Unregulated Capitalism That The Kochs Promote Runs Counter To Church Teaching." According to the Religion News Service, "Billionaire brothers Charles and David Koch recently made headlines by pledging nearly \$900 million to help elect candidates who support their libertarian strain of economic conservatism, but the industrialists are also nearly doubling their investment in the business school of Catholic University of America, which is overseen by the U.S. bishops. That's despite the fact that many Catholics — including Pope Francis — say the kind of unregulated capitalism that the Kochs promote runs counter to church teaching." [Religion News Service via Huffington Post, 2/2/15]

On Poverty

Francis: "Poverty In The World Is A Scandal;" It Is "Unfathomable" That There Are So Many "Poor Persons" Given The World's Wealth And Resources. According to the National Catholic Reporter, "As a Vatican press release today reports, Francis said: Poverty in the world is a scandal. In a world where there is so much wealth, so many resources to feed everyone, it is unfathomable that there are so many hungry children, that there are so many children without an education, so many poor persons. Poverty today is a cry. We all have to think if we can become a little poorer, all of us have to do this." [National Catholic Reporter, 6/7/13]

Francis: "I Encourage Financial Experts And Political Leaders" To "Ponder The Words" Of Saint John Chrysostom, Who Said That To "Not Share One's Wealth With The Poor Is To Steal From Them." According to Evangelii Gaudium by Pope Francis, "Ethics – a non-ideological ethics – would make it possible to bring about balance and a more humane social order. With this in mind, I encourage financial experts and political leaders to ponder the words of one of the sages of antiquity: 'Not to share one's wealth with the poor is to steal from them and to take away their livelihood. It is not our own goods which we hold, but theirs." [Pope Francis – Evangelii Gaudium, 11/24/13]

Francis: Welfare Projects Meet "Certain Urgent Needs," Though They "Should Be Considered Merely Temporary Responses." According to Evangelii Gaudium by Pope Francis, "Ethics – a non-ideological ethics – would make it possible to bring about balance and a more humane social order. With this in mind, I encourage financial experts and political leaders to ponder the words of one of the sages of antiquity: 'Not to share one's wealth with the poor is to steal from them and to take away their livelihood. It is not our own goods which we hold, but theirs." [Pope Francis – Evangelii Gaudium, 11/24/13]

Francis: A Just Economy Includes "An Integral Promotion Of The Poor Which Goes Beyond A Simple Welfare Mentality." According to Evangelii Gaudium by Pope Francis, "Growth in justice requires more than economic growth, while presupposing such growth: it requires decisions, programmes, mechanisms and processes specifically geared to a better distribution of income, the creation of sources of employment and an integral promotion of the poor which goes beyond a simple welfare mentality. I am far from proposing an irresponsible populism, but the economy can no longer turn to remedies that are a new poison, such as attempting to increase profits by reducing the work force and thereby adding to the ranks of the excluded." [Pope Francis – Evangelii Gaudium, 11/24/13]

Francis: "Some People Continue To Defend Trickle-Down Theories," Which Has "Never Been Confirmed By The Facts" And "Expresses A Crude And Naïve Trust In The Goodness Of Those Wielding Economic Power."

According to Evangelii Gaudium by Pope Francis, "In this context, some people continue to defend trickle-down theories which assume that economic growth, encouraged by a free market, will inevitably succeed in bringing about greater justice and inclusiveness in the world. This opinion, which has never been confirmed by the facts, expresses a crude and naïve trust in the goodness of those wielding economic power and in the sacralized workings of the prevailing economic system. Meanwhile, the excluded are still waiting." [Pope Francis – Evangelii Gaudium, 11/24/13]

Francis: The Poor Are Sacrificed At The "Altar Of Money;" Political And Business Leaders Should "Not Yield To An Economic Model Which Is Idolatrous, Which Needs To Sacrifice Human Lives On The Altar Of Money And Profit." According to CNN, "Pope Francis delivered yet another biting critique of contemporary capitalism on Saturday, saying the poor are often sacrificed on the 'altar of money' and accusing the wealthy of worshipping a new 'golden calf.' 'Certainly every culture needs economic growth and the creation of wealth,' the Pope told a group of civic leaders in Paraguay, the final stop of his weeklong trip to three South American countries. But political and business leaders have a responsibility to ensure that profits reach the pockets of the poor as well as the rich, he said. 'I ask them not to yield to an economic model which is idolatrous, which needs to sacrifice human lives on the altar of money and profit,' Francis said." [CNN, 7/10/15]

• Francis: The "Dictatorship Of An Impersonal Economy" Amounts To A "New And Ruthless Guise" Of The Ancient Pagan Worshipping Of Golden Calves "In The Idolatry Of Money." According to CNN, "The Pope said he gets 'snotty' when he hears highfalutin speeches from politicians that 'everyone knows are liars.' He compared corrupt regimes that convict political opponents on bogus charges to Hitler and Stalin. And he said the worshipping of golden calves — an ancient form of paganism — has 'returned in a new and ruthless guise in the idolatry of money and the dictatorship of an impersonal economy." [CNN, 7/10/15]

THE KOCH NETWORK HAS ARGUED THAT FREE-MARKET POLICIES, SUCH AS LIMITED GOVERNMENT, RIGHT-TO-WORK, LIMITING ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTIONS, ALLEVIATE POVERTY

LIBRE Initiative National Spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy: "Nothing Has Lifted More People Out Of Poverty That Entrepreneurial American Capitalism – Free Markets." According to an interview with LIRBE Initiative national spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on 620 WTMJ with host Charlie Sykes, "[RACHEL CAMPOS-DUFFY:] I would posit that, you know, nothing has lifted more people out of poverty than entrepreneurial American capitalism – free markets." [620 WTM] via Right Wisconsin, 9/16/15]

Washington Post: The Kochs Spent Their August 2015 Summit "Stressing Need To Help Lift People Out Of Poverty" And "Arguing That Limiting Government Is The Best Way To Achieve That." According to an article from the Washington Post, "The industrialist spent much of the weekend stressing the need to help lift people out of poverty — and arguing that limiting government is the best way to achieve that." [Washington Post, 8/3/15]

• Charles Koch: Efforts By The Koch Network To Address Poverty Have Been Insufficient, So The Network Will Take Its Efforts "To The Next Level," Working On Issues Such As A "Failing Educational System."

According to the Washington Post, "The network is now looking at other policies related to poverty, he said, such as 'a failing educational system. What we've been doing in the past is not sufficient,' [Charles] Koch added. 'We are going to have to raise our efforts to the next level." [Washington Post, 8/2/15]

Cato Institute Adjunct Scholar Craig Idso: "The Observed CO2-Induced Greening Of The Earth Portends Several Obvious Benefits For Both Society And Nature" Including "Reduc[ing] Poverty In Developing Nations." According to a blog post by Cato Institute adjunct scholar Craig Idso, "The observed CO2-induced greening of the Earth portends several obvious benefits for both society and nature. The increasing density and aerial coverage of vegetation, for example, helps to reduce the negative effects of soil erosion caused by the ravages of wind and rain. It also provides an increased source of food for both humanity and wild nature. Plant and animal biodiversity is also similarly stimulated, as vegetative productivity is highly correlated with biodiversity in natural habitats. And thanks to the recent work of Sedda et al. (2015), we now have another reason to celebrate CO2-induced greening—it is helping to reduce poverty in developing nations." [Cato.org/blog, 8/14/15]

- Idso: It Is Quite Certain "That The Historic And Ongoing Increase In The Air's CO2 Concentration Has Played A Significant Role In The Contemporaneous Reduction" In "Poverty." According to a blog post by Cato Institute adjunct scholar Craig Idso, "Because of the very positive connection that exists between landscape greening and atmospheric CO2 enrichment, as discussed earlier, it is quite plausible—if not certain—that the historic and ongoing increase in the air's CO2 concentration has played a significant role in the contemporaneous reduction in the portion of Earth's human population that has lived under poverty conditions, which currently stands at 21%, and which Sedda et al. say is "a reduction from 33% in 2000 and 43% in 1990," citing Ravallion (2012)." [Cato.org/blog, 8/14/15]
- Idso: "Why On God's Getting-Greener Earth Would The United Nations" "Work To Reduce The Anthropogenic CO2 Emissions That Are Demonstrably Raising Standard Of Living For So Many Of The World's Poor?" According to a blog post by Cato Institute adjunct scholar Craig Idso, "In light of these several observations, Sedda et al. conclude that since 'the relative location of people in poverty and child mortality is dependent on the values of NDVI,' a simple 'accounting for NDVI can reduce the number of indicators required to measure the intensity of poverty,' as well as to 'improve the geographic targeting of pro-poor interventions,' as a part of 'the upcoming United Nations Sustainable Development Goals framework' Why on God's getting-greener earth would the United Nations simultaneously work to reduce the anthropogenic CO2 emissions that are demonstrably raising standard of living for so many of the world's poor?" [Cato.org/blog, 8/14/15]

Americans For Prosperity President Tim Phillips On Income Inequality: "A Lot Of It Is Extolling The Virtues Of A System That's Lifted More People Out Of Poverty Than Anything Else In The History Of Mankind." According to RealClearPolitics, "With past issues, such as health care reform, AFP's strategy has been clear-cut: full-throated opposition. But making the case for Republicans on issues of income inequality will call for more nuance, Phillips said. 'Part of it's cultural, so it's not even necessarily making it an issue battle,' he said. 'A lot of it is extolling the virtues of a system that's lifted more people out of poverty than anything else in the history of mankind." [RealClearPolitics.com, 7/1/15]

Cato Institute Center For The Study Of Science Director Patrick Michaels: Fossil Fuels Are The Only Way To "Avoid A Life Of Poverty, Infirmity, And Vulnerability To Climate." According to an opinion by Director of the Center for the Study of Science at the Cato Institute Patrick Michaels for the Daily Caller, "Limiting access to energy will keep people poor and life short. Solar energy and windmills are never going to power a major modern city, and therefore they will never run a modern nation. With the exception of geographically-limited hydropower or sometimes unpopular nuclear fusion, the only way to avoid a life of poverty, infirmity, and vulnerability to climate is through the use of fossil fuels. They have been the engine of wealth and progress." [Patrick Michaels – Daily Caller, 6/19/15]

LIBRE Executive Director Daniel Garza: "People Are Increasingly Frustrated With The Inability Of The Federal Government To Reduce Poverty, And Have Become...Supportive Of 'Dismantling' Government." According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, "Daniel Garza, Executive Director of The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: 'Given the lack of real progress, it's no surprise that people are increasingly frustrated with the inability of the federal government to reduce Poverty, and have become more and more supportive of 'dismantling' government. While it is always encouraging to see jobs added to the economy, millions of workers and small businesses are simply not seeing their

bottom line improve. Our economy has been stumbling for too long with no indication of long-term wage growth and economic growth." [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, 5/8/15]

AFP-WV State Director Wendy McCuskey Supported Right To Work Legislation Because "It's Time To Change How We Approach Economic Growth, And If We Don't Adapt We Will Continue To See Poverty Rise." According to the Charleston Gazette, "Right to work legislation is vital to making West Virginia competitive and creating an environment of opportunity for all,' McCuskey said in a press release. It's time to change how we approach economic growth, and if we don't adapt we will continue to see poverty rise, wages stagnate and our quality of life disappear,' said McCuskey, whose group was founded with donations from the conservative donors Charles and David Koch." [Charleston Gazette, 2/1/15]

Faith In Public Life's Catholic Program Director John Gehring Pointed Out That The Kochs' "Self-Serving Policies" Benefit The "Privileged Few"

Gehring: "The Self-Serving Policies Promoted By A Vast Network Of Lobbying Groups Funded By" The Koch Brothers' Largesse "Rig The Game For A Privileged Few." According to an opinion by John Gehring, Catholic program director at Faith In Public Life, for Talking Points Memo, "The authors personally vouch for the fact that the Koch brothers have 'a deep concern for the least fortunate.' Their charitable giving is surely laudable. But even as the industrialists take pride in philanthropy, the self-serving policies promoted by a vast network of lobbying groups funded by their largesse rig the game for a privileged few at the expense of struggling families and the working poor. When a Koch foundation recently gave a \$1 million donation to the business school at The Catholic University of America in Washington, 50 prominent theologians and clergy reminded the university that the Koch's opposition to labor rights, environmental stewardship and Medicaid expansion 'contradict Catholic teaching on a range of moral issues." [John Gehring – Talking Points Memo, 12/2/14]

PROMINENT CATHOLICS HAVE NOTED THE DISPARITY BETWEEN CATHOLIC TEACHINGS AND THE KOCHS' POLITICAL AGENDA

Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga: "Capitalism Is Not A God" That Is "Perfect And Does Not Need Any Modification." According to the Religion News Service, "Capitalism is not a god. It is not a divinity. It is not a system that is perfect and does not need any modification,' he [Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga] said during a luncheon meeting. "This system is fostering tremendous inequalities." [Religion News, 4/30/15]

Religion News Service: "Many Catholics – Including Pope Francis – Say The Kind of Unregulated Capitalism That The Kochs Promote Runs Counter To Church Teaching." According to the Religion News Service, "Billionaire brothers Charles and David Koch recently made headlines by pledging nearly \$900 million to help elect candidates who support their libertarian strain of economic conservatism, but the industrialists are also nearly doubling their investment in the business school of Catholic University of America, which is overseen by the U.S. bishops. That's despite the fact that many Catholics — including Pope Francis — say the kind of unregulated capitalism that the Kochs promote runs counter to church teaching." [Religion News Service via Huffington Post, 2/2/15]

Commonweal's Associate Editor Grant Gallicho: "You Can't Drop A Few Catholic-Friendly Terms... Into A Blender With Ayn Rand's Philosophy And Produce Something That Flows Easily Into The Catholic Tradition." According to an opinion by associate editor Grant Gallico at Commonweal, "Busch is right that Catholic doctrine is down on crony capitalism and political collusion that degrades human dignity. But you can't drop a few Catholic-friendly terms--human dignity, subsidiarity, the common good--into a blender with Ayn Rand's philosophy and produce something that flows easily into the Catholic tradition. If that is what students of this Catholic business school are being fed, then they're not getting their money's worth. Although the Kochs may be getting theirs." [Grant Gallico – Commonweal, 1/27/15]

Michael Sean Winters For The National Catholic Reporter: The Koch Brothers' Political Agenda Is Not "The Least Bit Consistent With What The Catholic Church Teaches About Social Justice." According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter, "In this case, however, two Catholic philanthropists, John and Carol Saeman, do their best to make the case that their charitable donations to the Catholic Church are akin to their donations to 'the nonprofit community associated with Charles and David Koch, including Freedom Partners Chamber of Commerce.' The Saemans' speak of 'our shared conviction that limited government is most conducive to lifting people out of poverty' and they claim that 'Catholic teaching supports our conviction.' In this great, free country of ours, the Saemans are free to think what they want, and to spend their money as they wish. They are not entitled to claim the mantle of Catholic teaching for the

conviction that the Koch brothers' political agenda is the least little bit consistent with what the Catholic Church teaches about social justice." [Michael Sean Winters – National Catholic Reporter, 12/2/14]

- Winters: "The Charity To Which We Are Called Is Directly Opposed To The Dominant Capitalist, Consumer Culture The Koch Brothers And Their Friends Champion." According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter, "Let me stipulate, for the sake of argument, that the Saemans are generous, good-hearted people and that we should all commend them for their charitable donations. They note that when they met the pope, he spoke about the importance of charity. Indeed, as we all know, Pope Benedict XVI introduced the idea of charity as integral to Catholic Social Teaching in his masterful encyclical Caritas in Veritate. But, for both Pope Benedict and Pope Francis, charity has a deeper meaning than writing tax deductible checks at year's end. Charity is not a privatized activity of the rich, but a disposition of the heart and mind that should infuse both individual and societal behavior. Charity does not displace or replace justice in Benedict's or Francis' writings, but actually increases the demands on us all, urging us to not only work for social justice but to insist that the poor and the marginalized deserve more than justice. They deserve our love as well as our work for a more just society. In the writings of both Pope Benedict and Pope Francis, the charity to which we are called is directly opposed to the dominant capitalist, consumer culture the Koch brothers and their friends champion. This could not be more clear in Francis' apostolic exhortation Evangelii Gaudium, released one year ago." [Michael Sean Winters National Catholic Reporter, 12/2/14]
- Winters: The Saemans' Washington Post Op-Ed "Has An Orwellian Quality To It. The Words Of Pope Francis Are Gutted Of Their Obvious Meaning And Made To Justify A Libertarian Agenda." According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter, "The whole article by the Saemans has an Orwellian quality to it. The words of Pope Francis are gutted of their obvious meaning and made to justify a libertarian agenda. Words like 'limited government' mean something different to a libertarian than they do to most people. President Obama is not without his faults, but he is hardly a totalitarian. The Koch brothers and the 'nonprofit community' with which they are associated focuses on destroying the Affordable Care Act, they are opposed to environmental regulations, they have led the charge on anti-immigrant laws like Arizona's SB 1070 and on efforts in multiple states to make it harder for poor people and minorities to vote." [Michael Sean Winters National Catholic Reporter, 12/2/14]

Winters: "To Believe That The Teachings Of The Church Can Be Reconciled With The Koch Brothers' Agenda Is Alice In Wonderland-Quality Foolishness." According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter, "Certainly in Catholic Social Teaching, health care is a right and, following the principle of subsidiarity, if other social actors have repeatedly failed to provide it, the government must step in and do so. We can argue about the method, about this legislative action or that government regulation, but nowhere on the Koch agenda does one see any demonstrable effort to propose a real alternative to the ACA. Certainly, in the social doctrine of Pope Benedict, concern for environmental protection was dynamically embraced and brilliantly rooted in aspects of Christian scholarship that had not previously been used to address that issue. We all know Pope Francis' commitment to immigrants and his repeated, explicit denunciations of a 'culture of exclusion.' If I were looking for a particular example of a 'culture of exclusion,' I would point to the Koch's efforts at making it more difficult to vote. It is repugnant in the extreme. To believe that the teachings of the church can be reconciled with the Koch brothers' agenda is Alice in Wonderland-quality foolishness." [Michael Sean Winters – National Catholic Reporter, 12/2/14]

Winters: The Koch Agenda Is "Precisely The 'Poisoned Spring' About Which Pope Pius XI Spoke, The 'Erroneous Autonomy' About Which Pope Paul VI Spoke, And The Hyper-Individualistic, Materialistic Consumer Culture" Pope Francis Denounces. According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter, "Having said all that, I wish the Saemans well. I hope they will continue to donate large sums of money to the charities of the church. I hope, too, that they will come to recognize that the libertarian ideology of the Koch brothers is precisely the 'poisoned spring' about which Pope Pius XI spoke, the 'erroneous autonomy' about which Pope Paul VI spoke, and the hyper-individualistic, materialistic consumer culture against which Pope Francis could scarcely be more clear in his denunciations. Hope springeth eternal." [Michael Sean Winters – National Catholic Reporter, 12/2/14]

Winters: Koch-Funded Efforts To "Disenfranchise Poor People" Are The "Antithesis Of America's Founding Creed And Of The Christian Gospels." According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters in the National Catholic Reporter, "Indeed, many of these efforts to disenfranchise poor people are funded by very wealthy, conservative donors such as the Koch Brothers who put up big bucks to elect state legislators who will follow the dictates of well funded groups like the

American Legislative Exchange Council. Alas, to paraphrase the Master, the rich we will always have with us. But, shame on all of us, and especially my quiet conservative friends, who do not raise their voices against these bald efforts at voter suppression. No one should condone a culture of exclusion that is the antithesis of America's founding creed and of the Christian gospels." [Michael Sean Winters – National Catholic Reporter, 10/14/14]

Gehring: The Kochs' Fight For Deregulation Of Industries "That Make Them Very Wealthy" Contradicts Catholic Teaching, Which States That "Human Dignity" Should Not Be "Sacrificed By A Profit-Driven Utilitarianism." According to an opinion by John Gehring, Catholic program director at Faith In Public Life, for Talking Points Memo, "While the Kochs fight for sweeping deregulation of industries that make them very wealthy, Catholic teaching articulated by popes and bishops over the years assert the need for prudent oversight of markets so that human dignity is not sacrificed by a profit-driven utilitarianism. One of the pope's top advisors, Honduran Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga, spoke at a conference in Washington last summer and laid waste to the idea that Catholic teaching is compatible with libertarianism. Society must address the 'structural causes of poverty and injustice,' the cardinal said in a stinging rebuke to those who think the market's invisible hand can set us free." [John Gehring – Talking Points Memo, 12/2/14]

Koch Network Attacks On Pope Francis's Statements On His Economic Worldview

THE KOCHS' POLITICAL NETWORK HAS FOUGHT BACK AGAINST THE POPE'S COMMENTS ON CAPITALISM, ARGUING THAT THEIR POLICIES FIT WITHIN CATHOLIC TEACHING

Cato Institute Policy Analyst Alex Nowrasteh: "The Pope Is Correct That Free-Markets Are To Blame For Immigration, But Not In The Way He Thinks" Since People Choose To Seek Out The Prosperity Of Capitalistic Countries. According to a blog post by Cato Institute policy analyst Alex Nowrasteh for Cato's At Liberty Blog, "The Pope is correct that free-markets are to blame for immigration, but not in the way he thinks. The prosperity of free-market countries attracts large numbers of immigrants from less-free ones. Economists Maryam Naghsh Nejad and Andrew T. Young recently found that improving economic freedom is a huge attraction for immigrants. Fortunately that movement does not decrease economic freedom in receiving nations and may actually increase it according to this paper, but the lesson is that people who vote with their feet prefer relatively freer economic systems." [Cato.org/blog, 9/18/15]

• Nowrasteh: As "Pope Francis Is Generally Supportive Of Liberalizing Immigration Policy And Reducing Poverty," "He Should Realize That Free-Markets And The Migration Of Poor People To Them Is The Cheapest And Fastest Way To Alleviate Much Human Suffering." According to a blog post by Cato Institute policy analyst Alex Nowrasteh for Cato's At Liberty Blog, "Pope Francis is generally supportive of liberalizing immigration policy and reducing poverty around the world, but he should realize that free-markets and the migration of poor people to them is the cheapest and fastest way to alleviate much human suffering." [Cato.org/blog, 9/18/15]

Mercatus Center Senior Fellow Donald J. Boudreaux: Pope Francis's "Hostility Toward Capitalism Springs From Ignorance Of The Facts And A Deep Misunderstanding Of The Logic Of Markets." According to an opinion by Mercatus Center senior fellow Donald J. Boudreaux for Investor's Business Daily, "Yet as Pope Francis' numerous broadsides against capitalism reveal, many thoughtful people believe capitalism to be morally deficient. This hostility toward capitalism springs from ignorance of the facts and a deep misunderstanding of the logic of markets." [Donald J. Boudreaux – Investor's Business Daily, 9/17/15]

Boudreaux: The Pope Implies That "Humanity Escaped The Tyranny Of Communism Only To Fall Victim To The Tyranny Of Markets," But "Reality Refutes" A "Moral Equivalence Between Communism And Capitalism." According to an opinion by Mercatus Center senior fellow Donald J. Boudreaux for Investor's Business Daily, "Consider the Pope's accusation that capitalism is a "new tyranny." His implication is that humanity escaped the tyranny of communism only to fall victim to the tyranny of markets. But reality refutes his charge of moral equivalence between communism and capitalism." [Donald J. Boudreaux – Investor's Business Daily, 9/17/15]

Boudreaux: Capitalism "Doesn't Damage The Environment In The Way That The Pope Assumes," Since "Environmental Despoliation Is Mainly Found In Poor Non-Capitalist Countries." According to an opinion by Mercatus Center senior fellow Donald J. Boudreaux for Investor's Business Daily, "Capitalism also doesn't damage the

environment in the way that the Pope assumes. As Fr. Robert Sirico correctly noted in these pages in response to Francis' encyclical 'Laudato Si,' environmental despoliation is mainly found in poor non-capitalist countries rather than in rich capitalist ones." [Donald J. Boudreaux – Investor's Business Daily, <u>9/17/15</u>]

Cato Hosted An Event Questioning The Pope's Views On Capitalism And Economics. According to the Cato Institute, "By returning the focus of the Catholic Church to the plight of the poor, Pope Francis has become much loved and admired. His prestige and influence is commensurate with his humanity and humility. But is Francis right about capitalism and its consequences? Is it true that capitalism is a form of exploitation that leads to poverty and inequality? Or is it the only proven way of dramatically reducing poverty and, even, achieving unprecedented material abundance? Please join our distinguished panel for a discussion of Pope Francis's economics, and the Papal interpretation of economic history and the state of the world." [Cato Institute, 9/15/15]

• The Panel Discussion Was Moderated By Cato Editor Of HumanProgress.Org Marian Tupy, Who Condescendingly Argued In Event Literature That "Pope Francis Has A Big Heart, But His Credibility As A Voice Of Justice And Morality Would Be Immeasurably Improved If He Based His Statements On Facts." According to Right Wing Watch, "The CATO panel was moderated by Marian Tupy, editor of CATO's HumanProgress.org project. Tupy argued that the pope is ignoring evidence that capitalism has lifted millions of people out of poverty. Two of Tupy's articles critical of Francis's economic critiques were distributed at the event, one of which concluded condescendingly, 'Pope Francis has a big heart, but his credibility as a voice of justice and morality would be immeasurably improved if he based his statements on facts." [Right Wing Watch, 9/15/15]

Pacific Hospitality Group Founder And CEO Tim Busch: Capitalism Fits With Catholicism "Better Than Any Other Economic System" In Part Because "It Is Also The Single Most Effective Means Of Alleviating Poverty." According to an opinion by Tim Busch in the Wall Street Journal, "The encyclical, along with the resulting body of literature from successive popes, lays out the qualities that must be present in a just economic system. Among other things, the list includes the protection of private property and human freedom, a concern for the common good, and, most important, a deep respect for human dignity and a 'preferential option' for the poor. Capitalism meets these criteria better than any other economic system. It is also the single most effective means of alleviating poverty. In the past 20 years alone, it has lifted more than a billion people out of extreme poverty, according to the Economist. It is also single-handedly responsible for creating a global two-billion-person middle class over the past 300 years." [Tim Busch – Wall Street Journal, 1/22/15]

• National Catholic Reporter Journalist Michael Sean Winters: Tim Busch "Helped Put Together" A \$3 Million Gift To The Catholic University School Of Business, "Fully Half" Of Which Came From The Charles Koch Foundation. According to a post by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter's Distinctly Catholic blog, "Last week, the university announced a \$3 million gift to its School of Business that Mr. Busch helped put together. The gift garnered some media attention because fully half of it came from the Charles Koch Foundation. The Kochs gave a \$1 million gift to the school last year, and many on the left criticized the university for taking money from such a disreputable source." [NCRonline.org/blogs/Distinctly-Catholic, 1/28/15]

Busch: "Cronyism And Corruption" And "Corporate Welfare" Are "Rampant" Are "Perversions Of A Free-Market Economy That Do Not Fit Catholic Teaching." According to an opinion by Tim Busch for the Wall Street Journal, "But free markets only work within a moral culture. When business is unmoored from a concern for the common good, capitalism can slide into cronyism and corruption—exactly what Pope Francis has critiqued in recent months. It is such perversions of a free-market economy that do not fit Catholic teaching. These issues should be addressed in part through the education of future business leaders. Cronyism and corporate welfare are rampant across the world. Even in the U.S., they are increasingly evident in the interaction between business and politics. Business leaders now regularly and proudly collude with politicians and bureaucrats, boosting their companies' bottom lines at the expense of economic growth. There are subsidies that benefit the rich at the expense of the poor, handouts, mandates, favorable regulations and so on." [Tim Busch – Wall Street Journal, 1/22/15]

NRDC Action Fund Director Heather Taylor-Miesle Highlighted The Koch-Pope Rift In An Opinion For The Huffington Post

NRDC Action Fund Director Heather Taylor-Miesle: "The Koch Brothers Promote The Same Unregulated Capitalism Pope Francis Has Railed Against In The Past." According to an opinion by NRDC Action Fund Director Heather Taylor-Miesle for the Huffington Post, "The Koch brothers aren't just funding the fossil fuel opposition, they are

funding a lot of churches and universities. Earlier this year, the Charles Koch foundation gave \$1.75 million to Catholic University of America, part of a \$3 million pledge to the university. The money is to be used to create a school of business and economics. One must wonder what the curriculum will be since the Koch Brothers promote the same unregulated capitalism Pope Francis has railed against in the past." [Heather Taylor-Miesle – Huffington Post, 6/22/15]

LIBRE INITIATIVE SPOKESPERSON RACHEL CAMPOS-DUFFY CRITICIZED THE POPE'S COMMENTS ON CAPITALISM, AND CALLED FOR HIM TO ADDRESS THE "IMMIGRATION AND ASSIMILATION PROBLEM" IN THE U.S.

Campos-Duffy Will Be At The White House For Pope Francis's Welcoming Ceremony During His D.C. Visit. According to an interview with LIRBE Initiative national spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on 620 WTMJ with host Charlie Sykes, "[CHARLIE SYKES:] The big event politically next week is going to be the visit of Pope Francis to the United States. Joining me on the line is Rachel Campos-Duffy, who will be at the White House for the greeting ceremony." [620 WTM] via Right Wisconsin, 9/16/15]

Campos-Duffy: The Pope Has Called Capitalism "The Economic Colonization Which Subordinates Ethics To Profit," Which Sounds Like "A Lot Of Stuff I Heard In My Marxist Economics Class In Graduate School."

According to an interview with LIRBE Initiative national spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on 620 WTMJ with host Charlie Sykes, "[SYKES:] I know that a lot of conservatives are very, very conflicted about this. And you're a Catholic, I'm a Catholic. Pope is not a great fan of capitalism, is he? [RACHEL CAMPOS-DUFFY:] That's true. I think he calls it the economic colonization which subordinates ethics to profit. Sounds like a lot of stuff I heard in my Marxist economics class in graduate school." [620 WTM] via Right Wisconsin, 9/16/15]

Campos-Duffy: The Issues The Pope Espouses, Like Climate Change And A "Redistributionist View Of Economics," Are "Issues Of Prudential Judgement," So Catholics Are "Allowed" To Respectfully Disagree.

According to an interview with LIRBE Initiative national spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on 620 WTMJ with host Charlie Sykes, "[CAMPOS-DUFFY:] I think this man comes from a very good place. But a lot of the things that he is espousing and talking about – from climate change to, I think, a redistributionist view of economics – those are issues of prudential judgement, and I think that Catholics need to understand that they're allowed to disagree with the Pope on that – respectfully." [620 WTMJ via Right Wisconsin, 9/16/15]

Campos-Duffy: The Pope, Like President Obama, Sees The Answer To Ending Poverty In Government, And "Doesn't Really Trust The Individual To Help Solve That Problem." According to an interview with LIRBE Initiative national spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on 620 WTMJ with host Charlie Sykes, "[CAMPOS-DUFFY:] Frankly, I look at what the Pope says, and I think his goal is a good one, right? It's to end poverty, it's to help people. And I think that he sees the answer like our president does – a lot in government – and doesn't really trust the individual to help solve that problem." [620 WTMJ via Right Wisconsin, 9/16/15]

Campos-Duffy: The Pope Is "Right To Talk About Business Ethics," But "I Think The Free Market Is Not The Problem;" The Problem Is "A Cultural Degradation" That Reflects "The Way Income Is Distributed." According to an interview with LIRBE Initiative national spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on 620 WTMJ with host Charlie Sykes, "[CAMPOS-DUFFY:] In the case of free markets, the Pope is right to talk about business ethics – about our personal responsibility when we make money, and how more to give to other people. It's about a personal responsibility. And as a Catholic, I look at the situation. I think that the market, the free market is not the problem. I think the problem is a culture: a moral crisis that we have, a cultural degradation. And of course this moral crisis that we have in our country right now is going to reflect, you know, the way income is distributed." [620 WTMJ via Right Wisconsin, 9/16/15]

Campos-Duffy: The Pope "Actually Admits That He Knows Very Little About Economics." According to an interview of LIBRE Initiative spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on World Over with Raymond Arroyo, "Capitalism, or free enterprise, I agree is the worst system, except for everything else right? [...] RCD: It's not perfect and I think what it need is an injection of ethics and morality – which is lacking in the culture at all. And I think that maybe ought to be where the pope is speaking to, where is the culture? And are those moral principles, the ethics that would infuse business, are those infused in the culture at large? And I think that's where he should be – because frankly there's an article, I just received, he actually admits that he knows very little about economics." [World Over with Raymond Arroyo via YouTube, 7/16/15]

Campos Duffy: What Pope Francis Was Trying To Say On Capitalism Was "Lost In Translation" Because Of "His Own Perspective" And "Because Of His Own Words." According to an interview of LIBRE Initiative spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on World Over with Raymond Arroyo, Raymond Arroyo: "This is a man who grew up, spent most of his life in Argentina, hardly the free market capital of the world. Crony capitalism and Peronism, let's face it. And I think having that perspective that is his understanding of the economy. [...] 'I think he's actually calling for people to have a heart for the poor and not get lost in materialism. That I think that's what he's trying to say but its somehow being lost in translation, I think because of his own perspective.' Rachel Campos-Duffy: 'Because of his own perspective but also because of his own words. Just before Cardinal George passed away, god rest his soul, he actually talked about these confusing, sort of spatterings of statements from the pope that are contradictory. He sort of asks please don't be the one to make us sift through it, please be more clear so we understand where you're coming from." [World Over with Raymond Arroyo via YouTube, 7/16/15]

Campos-Duffy: When The Pope Stands Next To "An Authoritarian, Third Rate Populist" Like Evo Morales, It Sends A "Very Conflicting Message" On Class Warfare. According to an interview of LIBRE Initiative spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy on World Over with Raymond Arroyo, "In terms of class warfare, I think Mother Teresa said 'we don't need class warfare, what we need is a class encounter, where the rich save the poor and the poor save the rich. And I think that when he stands, when he goes to Latin America and he stands next to an authoritarian, third rate populist – who frankly has done a lot to erode the freedom, including religious freedom, Evo Morales, we know he's going to be in Cuba soon as well – it sends a very conflicting message. And we're not hearing enough about the people that are languishing in prisons in Cuba, the people that are languishing in prisons in, in Venezuela, because these figure, these authoritarian populist figure in Latin America that have arisen – these guys are squelching, squashing, the opposition. [...] And we're not hearing much about that." [World Over with Raymond Arroyo via YouTube, 7/16/15]

Campos-Duffy Hoped The Pope Would Address The Need For A "More Robust, Manly, Not Feminized Version Of Christianity," Part Of An "Immigration And Assimilation" Problem In The U.S. According to Raw Story, "We have an immigration and assimilation problem,' Campos-Duffy told Fox News host Harris Faulkner on Tuesday's edition of Outnumbered. 'Like, who are we actually inviting to come to our country? Do they embrace our culture? And what are we doing as a culture to help them assimilate and feel more apart of this and not have that separation that you're talking about.' Campos-Duffy, who is now a spokesperson for the Koch-funded Libre Initiative, suggested that Christianity was necessary to counteract the Muslim influence on young men. [...] 'If there were groups of Catholics, young Catholic men going to Rome and joining a Crusade, I guarantee you that the media and our government and this administration would be having a very different conversation," she insisted. [...] 'What is it? It is reforming Islam and it's also that Christianity needs to offer a more robust, manly, not feminized version of Christianity.' Campos-Duffy added that she hoped that Pope Frances [sic] would address the topic instead of climate change when he visited the U.S. in September." [Raw Story, 4/21/15]

Immigration

POPE FRANCIS HAS ADVOCATED FOR MORE HUMANE IMMIGRATION POLICIES, MAKING IT A "CENTERPIECE OF HIS TWO-YEAR PAPACY"

Washington Post: Pope Francis Has Made Humane Immigration "A Centerpiece Of His Two-Year Papacy." According to the Washington Post, "Karla Perez loves Pope Francis. Like her, he's a native Spanish speaker. He is also the first Latin American to lead the Catholic Church, and he talks easily about soccer and prefers public buses to luxury cars. Most of all, though, Perez loves this pope because he has made better treatment of immigrants a centerpiece of his two-year-old papacy." [Washington Post, 8/31/15]

Francis: Immigration Is A "Hallmark Of Our Society," Not An "Emergency" Or "Circumstantial And Sporadic Fact." According to a translation by Vatican Radio of a letter written by Pope Francis, "Globalization is a phenomenon that challenges us, especially in one of its principal manifestations which is emigration. It is one of the 'signs' of this time that we live in and that brings us back to the words of Jesus, 'Why do you not know how to interpret the present time?' (Lk 12,57). Despite the large influx of migrants present in all continents and in almost all countries, migration is still seen as an emergency, or as a circumstantial and sporadic fact, while instead it has now become a hallmark of our society and a challenge." [Pope Francis via Vatican Radio, 7/15/14]

Francis Criticized "Persons And Institutions" That "Close The Door" To Immigrants, Inviting His Followers To "Ask Forgiveness" From God For Their Actions. According to The Independent, "Pope Francis has strongly criticised nations that turn migrants away, claiming these countries would need to seek forgiveness from God for their actions. [...] Francis's remarks, made during his weekly audience in Vatican City, follow increasing focus on migrant populations. 'I invite you all to ask forgiveness for the persons and the institutions who close the door to these people who are seeking a family, who are seeking to be protected,' he told the audience." [The Independent, 6/18/15]

The Guardian: Francis Wrote A Letter To A Jesuit Priest In Arizona Encouraging Communities Near The U.S.-Mexico Border To Welcome Immigrants And End Discrimination. According to The Guardian, "Pope Francis has decried the 'inhuman' conditions facing migrants crossing the US-Mexico border and has encouraged communities there not to judge people by stereotypes but welcome migrants and work to end discrimination." [The Guardian, 2/5/15]

Francis: The Influx Of Central American Immigrant Children To The U.S. Is A "Humanitarian Emergency;" As A "First Urgent Measure," The Children Should Be "Welcomed And Protected." According to a translation by Vatican Radio of a letter written by Pope Francis, "I would also like to draw attention to the tens of thousands of children who migrate alone, unaccompanied, to escape poverty and violence: This is a category of migrants from Central America and Mexico itself who cross the border with the United States under extreme conditions and in pursuit of a hope that in most cases turns out to be vain. They are increasing day by day. This humanitarian emergency requires, as a first urgent measure, these children be welcomed and protected." [Pope Francis via Vatican Radio, 7/15/14]

• Francis: The Challenge Of Young Central American Migrants "Demands The Attention Of The Entire International Community So That New Forms Of Legal And Secure Migration May Be Adopted." According to a translation by Vatican Radio of a letter written by Pope Francis, "I would also like to draw attention to the tens of thousands of children who migrate alone, unaccompanied, to escape poverty and violence: This is a category of migrants from Central America and Mexico itself who cross the border with the United States under extreme conditions and in pursuit of a hope that in most cases turns out to be vain. [...] [T]his challenge demands the attention of the entire international community so that new forms of legal and secure migration may be adopted." [Pope Francis via Vatican Radio, 7/15/14]

Francis: "To Enter The United States From The Border With Mexico Would Be A Beautiful Gesture Of Brotherhood And Support For Immigrants." According to the Huffington Post, "[T]he pope raised the possibility of walking across the U.S.-Mexico border to show support for immigrants, according to a report from Spanish newswire EFE. 'To enter the United States from the border with Mexico would be a beautiful gesture of brotherhood and support for immigrants,' Francis told reporters aboard the papal airplane returning to Rome from the Philippines." [Huffington Post, 1/20/15]

• Cardinal Oscar Rodriguez Maradiaga: While Time Did Not Allow For The Pope To Cross The Border, He Is Likely To Talk About The Issue In His Speech To Congress. According to the Religion News Service, "Maradiaga reiterated that Francis would have liked to enter the U.S. by crossing the border with Mexico to make a point about welcoming immigrants, not building walls to keep them out. He said that while time did not allow for a border stopover, the pontiff was certain to raise the issue on Capitol Hill. 'Even here, the desert cannot be a tomb or a cemetery,' he said, referring to the migrants who often die trying to cross into Arizona or Texas." [Religion News Service, 4/30/15]

THE KOCH-BACKED LIBRE INITIATIVE AND ITS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR DANIEL GARZA HAVE BEEN INCONSISTENT ON IMMIGRATION ISSUES

Garza: For The GOP To Improve Upon Its 2012 Showing, Its Presidential Nominee Has To Show Appreciation For The Contributions Of Immigrants, But Doesn't Need To Support A Pathway To Citizenship. According to the Washington Examiner, "To improve upon the party's 2012 showing, the eventual Republican nominee doesn't have to support amnesty for illegal immigrants, but he does have to show appreciation for immigrants' contributions to American society and be willing to discuss immigration reform." [Washington Examiner, 7/7/15]

• ENGLISH TRANSLATION: Garza: "I Believe That The Ideal Case Is A Pathway To Citizenship."

According to a translation by American Bridge of a Spanish language interview of LIBRE Initiative executive director Daniel Garza for NY1 Noticias, "I believe that the ideal case is a pathway to citizenship. We have always said that, but

in what (pause), I believe what is possible, is a pathway/road to legality that can give us portability of jobs – one can change jobs – circulation where one can go to their country of origin, work security where one doesn't have to worry about being deported, where there is the unification of family – where everyone receives the visa under the father or mother. So there are opportunities to reconcile between those different positions, and I don't know, maybe at the end of the day and if it's the option on the table, if citizenship is the only option for Jeb Bush, I am certain that he will vote or support an agenda of that type." [Translation - NY1 Noticias, 7/14/15]

Garza: "Americans Are Growing Tired Of Politically Motivated Positions" On Immigration "That Go Far Beyond The National Consensus And Constitutional Limits." According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, "Daniel Garza, Executive Director of The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: [...] 'Immigration is an issue that cuts across party lines; which is why Americans are exasperated with the ambitious unilateral actions that the courts have been predisposed to reject. They are growing tired of politically motivated positions that go far beyond the national consensus and Constitutional limits. It is time for the Obama administration to put an end to its go-it-alone approach and join leadership on the Hill to usher in a bi-partisan effort Congress requires to achieve permanent, sensible reform. Americans are desperately needing leadership, voices who offer a sensible approach to tackling the real costs of a broken system. They're calling for clear solutions that addresses the 11 million undocumented immigrants who reside in America with no path forward." [LIBRE Initiative press Release, 5/11/15]

• LIBRE Initiative Executive Director Daniel Garza: Sen. Mary Landrieu "Voted To Tie The President's Hands On Immigration, And Latino Activists, In Particular, Could Be Expected To Heavily Criticize The Senator." According to an opinion by LIRBE Initiative executive director Daniel Garza for The Federalist, "On Sept. 18, Sen. Mary Landrieu, a Democrat from Louisiana, voted with many Senate Republicans to prevent the president from altering Immigration law by executive order. Landrieu had voted 'yes' on comprehensive Immigration reform last year, but now portrays herself as an opponent of what she calls 'amnesty'—mostly because it had become clear that many constituents disapproved of her vote for Immigration reform. Therefore, it shouldn't have been all that surprising when she changed her position, and voted against a top policy priority of many Latinos. Even the most amateur political observer would think that a change of this magnitude might be expected to draw a lot of attention. Landrieu had voted to tie the president's hands on Immigration, and Latino activists, in particular, could be expected to heavily criticize the senator. The last thing they need is to lose congressional support on their top priority. And the leading congressional advocates for reform, the Congressional Hispanic Caucus, would probably offer the harshest criticism. After all, it had been a tough few weeks for the caucus." [Daniel Garza – The Federalist, 9/29/14]

LIBRE Did Not Challenge Republican-Led Legislation In Nevada That "Would Make It More Difficult For Undocumented Immigrants To Work In Construction By Penalizing Their Employers." "While LIBRE helps immigrants pass their driver's tests, which helps them get to work, Democrats and Latino advocates say the group is silent when it comes to Republican-led legislation in Nevada that would make it harder for immigrants to live in the state. One such bill in the assembly, AB 133, introduced by state Assemblyman Ira Hansen, would make it more difficult for undocumented immigrants to work in construction by penalizing their employers. Critics say if LIBRE really has the best interest of Nevada immigrants at heart, they would fight legislation like this. Garza said the group has limited resources but doesn't rule out taking on Republicans. He noted they've already slammed Marco Rubio over sugar subsidies, for example." [Buzzfeed, 3/12/15]

- Conde: Garza's Work With LIBRE "Shows A Tragic Disregard For His Own Story," And Amounts To "Shutting The Door After You Are In." According to an opinion by contributor David Conde for La Voz, "For Daniel Garza to advocate a second class status for immigrants in America shows a tragic disregard for his own story. He also came out of the immigrant community and yet he and his parents can now exercise the rights and privileges of full residency and citizenship. [...] [Garza] also came out of the immigrant community and yet he and his parents can now exercise the rights and privileges of full residency and citizenship. To then turn around and try to deny the opportunity for others to achieve was his family has done says a lot about shutting the door after you are in. 'No se vale,' this is not right." [David Conde La Voz, 6/10/15]
- La Voz Contributing Writer Daniel Conde: Given His Migrant Worker Background, "You Would Think That Garza Would Dedicate His Non-Profit Work To Making A Difference In That Area." According to an opinion by contributor David Conde for La Voz, "It is curious that Daniel Garza anchors his personal story to being a migrant worker with immigrant parents. Coming from the horrible living conditions that characterizes the life of a migrant, you would think that he would dedicate his non-profit work to making a difference in that area." [David Conde La Voz, 6/10/15]

PR Watch: LIBRE "Tries To 'Rope Less-Informed Activists' Into Its Fold...By Being Intentionally Vague As To What Its Immigration Agenda Really Is." According to the Center for Media and Democracy's PR Watch, "True to its astroturf nature, LIBRE tries to 'rope less-informed activists' into its fold to create the appearance of a grassroots movement. It does so by being intentionally vague as to what its immigration agenda really is. The organization's splash page, for example, is set in stars-and-stripes colors while calling for volunteers for immigration reform. 'We're all in it together!' ('¡Estamos Contigo Por Una Reforma Migratoria!') But there are no specifics, no policy document, no FAQ – no mention of the fact that citizenship is not on the table." [Center for Media and Democracy PR Watch, 2/10/15]

• Latino Victory Project President Cristobal Alex On Garza: "I'm A Little Confused By His Position On Executive Action, But We Both Agree That Immigrants ... Should Be Able To Achieve The American Dream And For That We Need Access To Citizenship." According to BuzzFeed, "We're not looking at La Raza as Democrats,' Garza said. We see them as partners that can help us achieve desired policy outcomes.' And [Latino Victory Project President Cristobal] Alex isn't completely closed off to the idea. We agree on the ultimate need to pass comprehensive immigration reform that has a pathway to citizenship,' Alex said. 'I'm a little confused by his position on executive action, but we both agree that immigrants like our parents should be able to achieve the American dream and for that we need access to citizenship." [BuzzFeed, 7/24/15]

LIBRE On Obama's Executive Action: "While Many Welcomed The Relief, The Hispanic Community Is Not Blind To The Potential Negative Impacts," Such As It Possibly Being Overturned And Encouraging More Immigrants To Enter Or Remain In The U.S. According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, "The president's unilateral move is no substitute for the sort of legislative Immigration reform Latinos are calling for. While many welcomed the relief, the Hispanic community is not blind to the potential negative impacts of the president's actions - it is temporary, leaves many out, may be overturned in court, and may encourage more immigrants to enter or remain in the U.S. in violation of our laws. This is a serious problem - one that was foreseeable and should have been avoided. If the president wants to earn and keep the support of the Latino community, he needs to start truly listening to their concerns and seek bipartisan solutions." [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, 12/12/14]

• LIBRE Initiative Executive Director Daniel Garza Said Stopping Obama's Executive Actions On Immigration "Wouldn't Necessarily Be A Problem" If Republicans Introduced Bills "That Also Address The Undocumented Immigrant Population." According to the Huffington Post, "Their best hope is that 2016 Latino voters, most of whom support Obama's actions to keep some undocumented immigrants from being deported, will see it that way, too. [...] Getting rid of the executive actions wouldn't necessarily be a problem if Republicans introduced immigration reform bills that would also address the undocumented immigrant population, said Daniel Garza, executive director for The LIBRE Initiative. If you don't agree with the president's executive action, great -- repeal it, stop it, Garza said. But you have to propose alternatives. That's the problem." [Huffington Post, 2/12/15]

<u>LIBRE Does Not Support The Obama Administration's Deferred Action For Parents Of Americans</u> (DAPA)

NCLR President Janet Murguia Said LIBRE Is "Trying To Find A Place In The Debate On Immigration," But The "Hang Up" Is That The Group Supports DACA But Is "Against The 2014 Executive Actions Known As DAPA." According to BuzzFeed, "But NCLR president Janet Murguia told BuzzFeed News her organization is not opposed to working with groups who are engaging the community — she noted NCLR has worked with the Heritage Foundation before. But she said LIBRE, like any other group, will face scrutiny on the quality and substance of their ideas and policy stances. LIBRE, Murguia said, has reached out, and is 'trying to find a place in the debate on immigration,' but she said the hang up is that while the group supports Obama's 2012 Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) program it is against the 2014 executive actions known as DAPA, that would shield millions of parents from deportation, a stance she called 'inconsistent." [BuzzFeed, 7/24/15]

BuzzFeed: LIBRE "Supports The 2012 Program Because It Is Already In Place But Does Not Support DAPA Because It Confers Work Visas Without Congressional Approval." According to BuzzFeed, "Latino Victory Project has no intentions of working with any organization on immigration reform that believes we should get rid of DACA or DAPA,' Cristóbal Alex, the group's president said, referring to the 2012 and 2014 executive actions taken by the Obama administration, which shield young people brought to the country as children and parents of U.S. citizens from deportation,

respectively. LIBRE has sought to thread the needle on the issue: The group supports the 2012 program because it is already in place but does not support DAPA because it confers work visas without congressional approval and is held up in court." [BuzzFeed, 7/25/15]

THE KOCH BROTHERS HAVE FUNDED ADDITIONAL ORGANIZATIONS AND CANDIDATES THAT SUPPORT ANTI-IMMIGRANT POLICIES

Washington Post: The Kochs "Spend A Great Deal Of Their Money Supporting Republican Candidates Who Oppose Citizenship For Undocumented Immigrants." According to the Washington Post, "Paula Hernandez, 46, an undocumented restaurant supervisor from Mexico, was one of those sitting on folded chairs, listening. She has worked in the United States for 25 years and gave birth to three children here. She has never heard of the Koch brothers or LIBRE but said the free classes were a 'great help,' particularly because nobody else is lending her a hand. 'President Obama promised to do more for us, and it just didn't happen,' she said. To Republicans, that sounds like an opportunity — even though the Koch brothers and their conservative allies spend a great deal of their money supporting Republican candidates who oppose citizenship for undocumented immigrants." [Washington Post, 4/30/15]

Arizona's S.B. 1070

La Cross Tribune Columnist Harvey Witzenburg: "Arizona's Harsh Immigration Law" Is An Example Of A Law Written Using ALEC Model Bills. According to an opinion by columnist Harvey Witzenburg for the La Crosse Tribune, "Members of ALEC take these model bills, written behind closed doors, and introduce them in their state legislatures across our nation. ALEC boasts that 100 of its bills become law each year. This means an organization that is supported by big corporations is writing laws in many of our states. Arizona's harsh immigration law and the stand-your-ground laws passed in several states are just a few examples of laws written by ALEC." [Harvey Witzenburg – La Crosse Tribune, 7/26/15]

National Catholic Reporter Author Michael Sean Winters: The Koch Brothers Have "Led The Charge On Anti-Immigrant Laws Like Arizona's SB 1070." According to an opinion by Michael Sean Winters for the National Catholic Reporter, "The Koch brothers and the 'nonprofit community' with which they are associated focuses on destroying the Affordable Care Act, they are opposed to environmental regulations, they have led the charge on anti-immigrant laws like Arizona's SB 1070 and on efforts in multiple states to make it harder for poor people and minorities to vote." [Michael Sean Winters – National Catholic Reporter, 12/2/14]

• Michael Sean Winters Is An Author And Visiting Fellow At Catholic University's Institute For Policy Research And Catholic Studies. According to Michael Sean Winters' biography on the National Catholic Reporter website, "Michael Sean Winters is the author of Left At the Altar: How Democrats Lost The Catholics And How Catholics Can Save The Democrats (Basic Books, 2008). His biography of the Rev. Jerry Falwell, God's Right Hand: How Jerry Falwell Made God a Republican and Baptized the American Right was published by Harper One in January 2012 to critical acclaim. He is a Visiting Fellow at Catholic University's Institute for Policy Research and Catholic Studies." [NCROnline.org, accessed 6/10/15]

Rep. Pompeo: "I Am Committed To" Securing The Border, Eliminating "All Government Assistance For Illegal Immigrants," And Enforcing "Current Immigration Laws – Including Arizona's New Immigration Law." According to a web post on U.S. Congressman Mike Pompeo's website, "I strongly oppose amnesty for illegal immigrants. Such legislation will only reward illegal behavior and encourage other immigrants to enter the United States illegally. Respecting the rule of law is a critical aspect of being a U.S. citizen. Our nation must not provide special access to citizenship for those who have broken our laws. Instead, I am committed to a conservative agenda aimed at addressing illegal immigration: Secure our borders[.] Eliminate all government assistance for illegal immigrants[.] Enforce current immigration laws—including Arizona's new immigration law." [Pompeo.house.gov, accessed 9/15/15]

• Center For Responsive Politics: Koch Industries Donated \$294,000 To Pompeo Between 2010 And 2014, More Than Any Other Federal Candidate For Three Consecutive Cycles. According to the Center for Responsive Politics, U.S. representative Mike Pompeo received \$80,000 from Koch Industries during the 2010 cycle, \$110,000 during the 2012 cycle, and \$104,000 during the 2014 cycle. The second-largest recipient was U.S. House candidate Jerry Moran in 2010 (\$41,550), presidential candidate Mitt Romney in 2012 (\$76,850), and U.S. Senate candidate Dan Sullivan in 2014 (\$42,350). [Center for Responsive Politics, accessed 9/15/15]

Obama's Executive Actions

New York Times: Conservative Groups, Including Freedom Partners, Fought To "Reverse Mr. Obama's Executive Orders On Immigration." According to the New York Times, "But the rift between conservatives and the Republican leadership has been most acute with respect to the Ex-Im Bank. Conservative groups like Heritage Action, the political arm of the Heritage Foundation, and the Kochs' Freedom Partners saw a chance to deal a blow to President Obama, after losing fights to defund the Affordable Care Act and reverse Mr. Obama's executive orders on immigration. They hoped that if they could make sure Congress did nothing to save the bank, its future lending operations would go dark this summer." [New York Times, 7/26/15]

Washington Times: Cato Institute Filed Briefs Challenging President Obama's Immigration Executive Action. According to the Washington Times, "President Obama's new deportation amnesty will impose 'billions of dollars in costs' on states, they told a federal court this week — including more than \$130 for each Texas driver's license issued to illegal immigrants under the policy. [...] Meanwhile, the Cato Institute has filed briefs challenging the program. Ilya Shapiro, senior fellow for constitutional studies at Cato, said the case should test just how broadly states are able to challenge federal laws on behalf of their residents. Mr. Shapiro said given gridlock and the penchant for presidents to act on their own, the case could have a huge impact. 'All of this is pretty new in the sense that the administration is coming up with creative ways of governing without Congress,' he said." [Washington Times, 1/11/15]

• Washington Times: "Cato's Involvement [In Deportation Lawsuit] Is Intriguing Because, As A Libertarian-Leaning Think Tank, It Generally Agrees With Legalizing Illegal Immigrants." According to the Washington Times, "Cato's involvement [in deportation lawsuit] is intriguing because, as a libertarian-leaning think tank, it generally agrees with legalizing illegal immigrants. But Mr. [Ilya] Shapiro said sometimes 'something can be good policy yet bad law." [Washington Times, 1/11/15]

2016 Presidential Candidates

Gov. John Kasich

Columbus Dispatch: David Koch Donated The Legal Maximum Of \$12,155 To Gov. John Kasich's Reelection Campaign In April 2014. According to the Columbus Dispatch, "The Democrat [Ed FitzGerald] has \$1.9 million on hand after raising \$860,000, failing to make a dent in the \$7 million advantage Kasich carried over him in April. [...] Kasich's contributors was David Koch of the conservative, energy-conglomerate Koch Industries, who contributed the maximum \$12,155." [Columbus Dispatch, 6/13/14]

• Columbus Dispatch: Kasich Expressed Support For "Amending The U.S. Constitution To End Birthright Citizenship For Children Born Here To Illegal Immigrants," Before Softening His Position In 2014.

According to the Columbus Dispatch, "A little more than four years ago, John Kasich told The Dispatch, 'One thing that I don't want to reward is illegal immigration.' He called for a comprehensive federal immigration law protecting America's borders. And he reiterated his longtime support for amending the U.S. Constitution to end birthright citizenship for children born here to illegal immigrants." [Columbus Dispatch, 11/21/14]

Sen. Ted Cruz

Center For Responsive Politics: Koch Industries Donated \$23,750 To Ted Cruz's Senatorial Campaign In 2012. According to the Center for Responsive Politics, Ted Cruz received \$23,750 as a candidate for the U.S. Senate during the 2012 cycle. [Center for Responsive Politics, accessed 9/15/15]

- Cruz Said He Is "Categorically Opposed" To A Path To Citizenship At The Texas Senate Republican Primary Runoff Debate In 2012. According to a video posted by Ted Cruz for US Senate on YouTube, "[TED CRUZ:] I am categorically opposed to amnesty. Amnesty is wrong, it's contrary to rule of law and it's unfair to the millions of legal immigrants who waited in line and came here legally." [Ted Cruz YouTube, 7/9/12]
- The Daily Texan: Cruz "Denounced Obama's Deferred Action For Undocumented Youth And Opposes The DREAM Act." According to The Daily Texan, "If elected, Cruz pledged to do away with President Barack Obama's health care reform and to lower the amount of spending in Washington. He also denounced Obama's

deferred action for undocumented youth and opposes the DREAM Act, legislation that would legalize certain young, undocumented immigrants." [Daily Texan, 11/7/12]

Carly Fiorina

Center For Responsive Politics: Koch Industries Donated \$20,000 To Carly Fiorina's Senatorial Campaign In 2010. According to the Center for Responsive Politics, Carly Fiorina received \$20,000 as a candidate for the U.S. Senate during the 2010 cycle. [Center for Responsive Politics, accessed 9/15/15]

• Fiorina In 2010: Barbara Boxer "Vilifies" Arizonans And "Challenges The Constitutionality" Of Arizona's S.B. 1070" Instead Of Telling President Obama To Secure The Border. According to a Fox News interview of U.S. Senate candidate Carly Fiorina on Fox News Sunday with host Chris Wallace, "[CHRIS WALLACE:] On illegal immigration, you support the Arizona crackdown, the new law in Arizona. What do you say to those Latino voters-and it's a big voting bloc in California--who say this is going to lead to racial profiling? [CARLY FIORINA:] [...] The federal government isn't doing its job. It's the federal government's job to secure the border. The Obama administration has de-funded securing the border. While Barbara Boxer stands up and challenges the constitutionality of the Arizona law and vilifies people of Arizona, what she should be doing--what I would be doing--is figuratively standing on the president's desk and saying, 'Mr. President, the federal government needs to do its job and secure the border." [Fox News, 6/13/10]

Sen. Marco Rubio

Center For Responsive Politics: Koch Industries Donated \$32,000 To Marco Rubio's Senatorial Campaign In 2010. According to the Center for Responsive Politics, Marco Rubio received \$32,000 as a candidate for the U.S. Senate during the 2010 cycle. [Center for Responsive Politics, accessed 9/15/15]

• Rubio In 2010: "We Have A Path For Citizenship. It's Called Coming Legally Into This Country...America Cannot Be The Only Country In The World That Does Not Observe Or Enforce Its Immigration Laws." According to an interview of Republican U.S. Senate candidate Marco Rubio for Human Events by editor Jason Mattera: "[JASON MATTERA:] Are you in favor of creating a path for citizenship for the millions who are here? [MARCO RUBIO:] Well, we have a path for citizenship. It's called coming legally into this country. [...] America cannot be the only country in the world that does not observe or enforce its immigration laws. A key part of your sovereignty is the ability to control the influx and out flow of your people is the ability to secure your border. And you're never going to be able to do that if you have an immigration system that says "come to this country illegally. If you're able to stay here long enough, you're able to stay here forever." And you're never going to have a legal immigration system that works if you grant amnesty." [Human Events, 5/6/10]

Bobby Jindal

AFP Foundation Senior Policy Fellow Peggy Venable Promoted Bobby Jindal's Statement That Immigrants To America "Should Come Legally, Learn English, Adopt Our Values And Get To Work." According to a tweet by AFP Foundation Senior Policy Fellow Peggy Venable, "[]Folks who want to come to America should come legally, learn English, adopt our values and get to work.' -- LA Gov. Bobby Jindal #RSG15" [Twitter, 8/10/15]

Climate Change

POPE FRANCIS RELEASED AN ENCYCLICAL CALLING ON THE WORLD TO ADDRESS GLOBAL WARMING

Pope Francis: "Climate Change Is A Global Problem With Grave Implications," And Is "One Of The Principal Challenges Facing Humanity In Our Day." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Climate change is a global problem with grave implications: environmental, social, economic, political and for the distribution of goods. It represents one of the principal challenges facing humanity in our day." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

Francis: "A Very Solid Scientific Consensus Indicates That We Are Presently Witnessing A Disturbing Warming Of The Climatic System." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "A very solid scientific consensus indicates that we are presently witnessing a disturbing warming of the climatic system. In recent decades this warming has been accompanied by a constant rise in the sea level and, it would appear, by an increase of extreme weather events, even if a scientifically determinable cause cannot be assigned to each particular phenomenon." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

• Francis: Global Warming Is Primarily Caused By "The Great Concentration Of Greenhouse Gases," And Is "Aggravated By A Model Of Development Based On The Intensive Use Of Fossil Fuels." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "It is true that there are other factors (such as volcanic activity, variations in the earth's orbit and axis, the solar cycle), yet a number of scientific studies indicate that most global warming in recent decades is due to the great concentration of greenhouse gases (carbon dioxide, methane, nitrogen oxides and others) released mainly as a result of human activity. [...] The problem is aggravated by a model of development based on the intensive use of fossil fuels, which is at the heart of the worldwide energy system." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

Francis: "Climate Change Is A Global Problem With Grave Implications," And Is "One Of The Principal Challenges Facing Humanity In Our Day." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Climate change is a global problem with grave implications: environmental, social, economic, political and for the distribution of goods. It represents one of the principal challenges facing humanity in our day." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, <u>5/24/15</u>]

Francis: "There Is An Urgent Need To Develop Policies So That, In The Next Few Years, The Emission Of Carbon Dioxide And Other Highly Polluting Gases Can Be Drastically Reduced." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Many of those who possess more resources and economic or political power seem mostly to be concerned with masking the problems or concealing their symptoms, simply making efforts to reduce some of the negative impacts of climate change. However, many of these symptoms indicate that such effects will continue to worsen if we continue with current models of production and consumption. There is an urgent need to develop policies so that, in the next few years, the emission of carbon dioxide and other highly polluting gases can be drastically reduced, for example, substituting for fossil fuels and developing sources of renewable energy." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

Francis: "Recent World Summits On The Environment" Were "Unable To Reach Truly Meaningful And Effective Global Agreements On The Environment." According to Laudato Si by Pope Francis, "Worldwide, the ecological movement has made significant advances, thanks also to the efforts of many organizations of civil society. It is impossible here to mention them all, or to review the history of their contributions. But thanks to their efforts, environmental questions have increasingly found a place on public agendas and encouraged more far-sighted approaches. This notwithstanding, recent World Summits on the environment have not lived up to expectations because, due to lack of political will, they were unable to reach truly meaningful and effective global agreements on the environment." [Pope Francis – Laudato Si, 5/24/15]

OTHERS ECHOED THE POPE'S STATEMENTS IN THE MEDIA, AND HIGHLIGHTED OPPOSITION FROM CAPITALIST GROUPS

Archbishop Of Suacia Bernadito Auza Speculated That The Pope Would Speak About Sustainable Development, Climate Change, And Peace During His Speech To The U.N. According to the Huffington Post, "Auza's comments reflected an overarching theme of the bishops' predictions -- that just because something is on the pope's schedule does not mean it will happen as scripted. Nonetheless, Auza expects the pope's U.N. address to touch on sustainable development, climate change and peace. The pope also 'won't shy away from' talking about issues on which his stance differs from that of many U.N. member nations, Auza added." [Huffington Post, 8/29/15]

NRDC Action Fund Director Heather Taylor-Miesle: "As The Pope Establishes Climate Action As A Moral Imperative Among Christians, The Kochs' Climate Obstruction May Lose Its Appeal Among The Faithful." According to an opinion by NRDC Action Fund Director Heather Taylor-Miesle for the Huffington Post, "As the pope establishes climate action as a moral imperative among Christians, the Kochs' climate obstruction may lose its appeal among the faithful. It will matter how Catholics react and whether this will drive a wedge between the Tea Party movement and the religious community. A major wedge could hurt voter enthusiasm in the Republican Party." [Heather Taylor-Miesle – Huffington Post, 6/22/15]

University of St. Thomas Catholicism Expert Charles Reid Jr.: Pope Francis's Words On The Environment Are "Not A Break With What Other Popes Have Done...It's Not A Radical Departure." According to Salon, "I called up

Charles Reid Jr., an expert on Catholicism and canon law at the University of St. Thomas in Minnesota who blogs at the Huffington Post, to discuss the pope's upcoming encyclical and the chilly reception he's receiving from GOP Catholics. Our conversation has been lightly edited for clarity. [...] 'Pope Benedict addressed climate change, though never in an encyclical. I mean this is not ... it's a development, it's a furtherance, it's a growth of papal teaching, but it's not a break with what other popes have done. Pope Benedict XVI was saying similar things, but in a typically more soft-spoken manner. So, Pope Francis is stating these things more emphatically, but it's not a radical departure." [Salon, 6/5/15]

Columnist Richard Kamischke Opinion: "Predictably, The Pope Is Getting Attacked By Those Who Stand To Lose By Acting In The Best Interest Of, Literally, All Of Humankind." According to an opinion by columnist Richard Kamischke for the Grand Haven Tribune, "Predictably, the pope is getting attacked by those who stand to lose by acting in the best interest of, literally, all of humankind. Leading the charge is the Heartland Institute, a group financed by billionaire Charles Koch. Unsurprisingly, Mr. Koch's 'science' on climate change and his business interests align perfectly." [Richard Kamischke – Grand Haven Tribune, 6/5/15]

Politico: "The Pope's Closest Adviser," Cardinal Oscar Rodríguez Maradiaga "Slammed Climate-Change Skeptics, Blaming Capitalist Motivations" From "Movements" In The US For Fighting The Pope's Climate Advocacy. According to Politico, "The pope's closest adviser on Tuesday slammed climate-change skeptics, blaming capitalist motivations from 'movements in the United States' for opposing the Catholic Church leader's upcoming environmental letter. The ideology surrounding environmental issues is too tied to a capitalism that doesn't want to stop ruining the environment because they don't want to give up their profits,' said Cardinal Oscar Rodríguez Maradiaga at a news conference in Rome marking the start of Caritas Internationalis, an annual meeting of Catholic charitable groups, according to The Boston Globe." [Politico, 5/12/15]

• Cardinal Oscar Maradiaga: "The Ideology Surrounding Environmental Issues Is Too Tied To A Capitalism That Doesn't Want To Stop Ruining The Environment Because They Don't Want To Give Up Their Profits." According to Politico, "The ideology surrounding environmental issues is too tied to a capitalism that doesn't want to stop ruining the environment because they don't want to give up their profits,' said Cardinal Oscar Rodríguez Maradiaga at a news conference in Rome marking the start of Caritas Internationalis, an annual meeting of Catholic charitable groups, according to The Boston Globe." [Politico, 5/12/15]

Mother Jones' Kevin Drum: "A Sizeable Majority Of US Catholics... Share The Pope's Belief That The Climate Change Is A Serious Threat. Heartland" Is "Trying To Shift Their Views By Portraying Climate Activists As Hostile To Catholic Values." According to an opinion by columnist Kevin Drum for Mother Jones, "As my colleague James West reported, a sizeable majority of US Catholics actually share the pope's belief the climate change is a serious threat. Heartland seems to be trying to shift their views on the issue by portraying climate activists as hostile to Catholic values." [Kevin Drum – Mother Jones, 4/27/15]

THE KOCH-FUNDED HEARTLAND INSTITUTE WENT ON THE OFFENSIVE AGAINST THE POPE'S ENCYCLICAL

TPM: Heartland Institute President Gene Koprowski Compared Pope Francis's Statements On The Environment To Pagan "Nature Worship." According to TPM, "A leader [president Gene Koprowski] at the Heartland Institute, a conservative group backed by the Koch brothers focused on skepticism of climate change, on Thursday compared Pope Francis' focus on the environment to elements of paganism present in Christianity in the Middle Ages. [...] "This is a pagan ritual, pagan remnants that were seeping into the church. One of them also was "nature worship." What is environmentalism but nature worship?" [TPM, 9/18/15]

• Koprowski: "I'm Wondering...If Pagan Forms Are Returning To The Church This Day. I Think That If We Have A Pope Who Doesn't View Things In The Orthodox Manner, We're Going To Be Having Forms Returning To The Religion That Are Not Orthodox." According to TPM, "He then suggested that Pope Francis' focus on the environment shows that paganism is making its way back into the Catholic church. 'I'm wondering, as a scholar, if pagan forms are returning to the church this day,' he said. 'I think that if we have a pope who doesn't view things in the orthodox manner, we're going to be having forms returning to religion that are not orthodox." [TPM, 9/18/15]

TPM: The Heartland Institute Announced That It Would Join A Coalition "Challenging The Pope's Views On Global Warning And The Nature Of Capitalism." According to TPM, "Gene Koprowski, the director of marketing at the group, spoke at a press conference announcing the Heartland Institute's plan to join a coalition 'challenging the pope's views on global warming and the nature of capitalism." [TPM, 9/18/15]

CNN: "If There Were A Headquarters For U.S.-Based Opposition To Pope Francis' Climate Change Plans, It Would Be Chicago. That's The Home Of The Heartland Institute." According to CNN, "If there were a headquarters for U.S.-based opposition to Pope Francis' climate change plans, it would be Chicago. That's the home of the Heartland Institute, a libertarian public policy think tank that has organized conferences, churned out podcasts, videos, and white papers, and recently arranged a trip to Rome -- all in an effort to build opposition to the pope's environmental message." [CNN Money, 6/17/15]

• CNN: The Heartland Institute "Organized Conferences, Churned Out Podcasts, Videos And White Papers, And Recently Arranged A Trip To Rome... To Build Opposition To The Pope's Environmental Message." According to CNN, "That's the home of the Heartland Institute, a libertarian public policy think tank that has organized conferences, churned out podcasts, videos, and white papers, and recently arranged a trip to Rome -- all in an effort to build opposition to the pope's environmental message." [CNN Money, 6/17/15]

At A Heartland Conference, Lord Christopher Monckton Compared Pope Francis's Acceptance Of Climate Science To Pope Urban VIII, Who Arrested Galileo For Claiming The Earth Revolved Around The Sun. According to CNN, "Countering the pope: Last week, Heartland, which has an annual budget of \$6 million and about 30 staffers, organized its Tenth International Conference on Climate Change, a two-day seminar in Washington, D.C., focused on repudiating the view that climate change is caused by man. The gathering featured speeches by Senator Jim Inhofe and Britain's Lord Christopher Monckton, both well-known climate change skeptics and critics of Francis' entry into the hotly debated topic. During his address, Monckton explained what can happen when religious leaders wade into matters of science by citing Pope Urban VIII, who in the 17th century put Galileo under house arrest for his theory that the Earth and other planets revolve around the sun." [CNN Money, 6/17/15]

CNN: "Leaders Of Heartland Told CNNMoney That They Reject The Pontiff's Reported Claim That Human Activities Cause Global Warming, Believe That He Should Stay Out Of The Issue, And Charged Francis Has Been Misled By Leftist Scientists And Activists." According to CNN, "Ahead of the release of the pope's encyclical Thursday, leaders of Heartland told CNNMoney that they reject the pontiff's reported claim that human activities cause global warming, believe that he should stay out of the issue, and charged Francis has been misled by leftist scientists and activists." [CNN Money, 6/17/15]

• Heartland's H. Sterling Burnett: "We Hope To See The Pope's Encyclical Tempered Or Modified To Reflect Evidences That Disclaim Human Activities Cause Climate Change." According to CNN, "We hope to see the pope's encyclical tempered or modified to reflect evidences that disclaim human activities cause climate change,' said H. Sterling Burnett, managing editor of one of heartland's environmental newsletters." [CNN Money, 6/17/15]

Mother Jones' Kevin Drum: Heartland Is "Encouraging Its Followers To Send Letters And Emails To The Pope And Spread The Gospel Of Global Warming Denial To Their Local Church Officials." According to an opinion by columnist Kevin Drum for Mother Jones, "Heartland is also encouraging its followers to send letters and emails to the pope and to spread the gospel of global warming denial to their local church officials. "Talk to your minister, priest, or spiritual leader," advises Heartland's website. "Tell him or her you've studied the global warming issue and believe Pope Francis is being misled about the science and economics of the issue."" [Kevin Drum – Mother Jones, 4/27/15]

Heartland Institute Research Fellow H. Sterling Burnett: Those Pushing For The Pope To Weigh In On Climate Change Support "Forcible Population Control Programs, Which Is "Not A Christian Opinion." According to an opinion by the Heartland Institute's H. Sterling Burnett for the American Spectator, "The same people pushing the pope to join the fight against climate change support forcible population control programs such as those operating in China. That is not a Christian position." [H. Sterling Burnett – American Spectator, 4/27/15]

Heartland: "The Apparent New Papal Position" On Climate Change Represents "The Rejection Of Judeo-Christianity's Illustrious Tradition Of Scientific Inquiry." According to a blog post on the Heartland Institute website, "At the most fundamental level, too many IPCC reports and the apparent new papal position represent the rejection of Judeo-

Christianity's illustrious tradition of scientific inquiry, which has brought monumental improvements to our understanding of nature and creation – and to humanity's once 'nasty, brutish and short' lives on this planet. As Nobel Prize-winning physicist Richard Feynman explained, we begin with a guess about a law of nature. Then we compute the consequences that would result if our hypothesis is correct – and compare actual observations, evidence and experimental data to the predicted consequences." [Blog.Heartland.org, 4/27/15]

• Heartland: If Pope Francis "Is Truly Committed To Advancing Science, The Poor And Creation, He Should Reject Climate Chaos Claims." According to a blog post on the Heartland Institute website, "Pope Francis apparently does not share his predecessor's view about climate change fears. However, if he is truly committed to advancing science, the poor and creation, he should reject climate chaos claims unless and until alarmists can provide solid evidence to back up their assertions and models." [Blog.Heartland.org, 4/27/15]

The Guardian: The Heartland Institute, Which Received Funding From "The Foundation Controlled By Conservative Activist Charles Koch Is Trying To Persuade The Vatican That 'There Is No Global Warming Crisis." According to the Guardian, "A US activist group that has received funding from energy companies and the foundation controlled by conservative activist Charles Koch is trying to persuade the Vatican that 'there is no global warming crisis' ahead of an environmental statement by Pope Francis this summer that is expected to call for strong action to combat climate change. The Heartland Institute, a Chicago-based conservative thinktank that seeks to discredit established science on climate change, said it was sending a team of climate scientists to Rome 'to inform Pope Francis of the truth about climate science." [Guardian, 2/24/15]

• The Guardian: Heartland Said It Is Sending A Team Of Scientists To Rome "To Inform Pope Francis Of The Truth About Climate Science." According to the Guardian, "A US activist group that has received funding from energy companies and the foundation controlled by conservative activist Charles Koch is trying to persuade the Vatican that 'there is no global warming crisis' ahead of an environmental statement by Pope Francis this summer that is expected to call for strong action to combat climate change. The Heartland Institute, a Chicago-based conservative thinktank that seeks to discredit established science on climate change, said it was sending a team of climate scientists to Rome 'to inform Pope Francis of the truth about climate science." [Guardian, 2/24/15]

The Heartland Institute Has Received More Than \$16.3 Million From The Koch Network, Including \$15,610,544 From Donors Capital Fund From 2005 To 2013

Charles Koch Said That He Provided "Support" For A Number Of Conservative Organizations, Including The Heartland Institute. "I provided the seed money for the Institute for Justice, and support for a wide range of other market-oriented organizations including National Center for Policy Analysis (NCPA), American Legislative Exchange Council (ALEC), National Foundation for Teaching Entrepreneurship (NFTE), Pacific Research Institute, Acton Institute for the Study of Religion and Liberty, Fraser Institute, Reason Magazine, Competitive Enterprise Institute (CEI), and Heartland Institute." [Creating A Science of Liberty, 1/11/1997]

Heartland Received A Donation "Of \$25,000 In 2012 From The Charles G Koch Foundation." According to the Guardian, "The Heartland Institute says it is a non-profit organisation that seeks to promote 'free-market solutions' to social and economic problems. It does not disclose its donors, but says on its website that it has received a single donation of \$25,000 in 2012 from the Charles G Koch Foundation, which was for the group's work on health care policy. Charles Koch is the billionaire co-owner of Koch Industries, an oil refining and chemicals group, and is a major donor to Republicans causes and politicians. Heartland said contributions from oil and tobacco groups have never amounted to more than 5% of its income." [Guardian, 2/24/15]

Heartland Has Received \$40,000 From The Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation. According to Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation tax documents, the Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation gave the Heartland Institute a total of \$40,000 from 1992 to 1999 [Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation Form 990s via Conservative Transparency, accessed 6/17/15]

• After The Death Of "Dedicated Philanthropist And Conservative" Claude R. Lambe, Charles Koch Took Over His Foundation. According to the book *Creating a Private Foundation: The Essential Guide for Donors and Their Advisers*, "Claude R. Lambe, a dedicated philanthropist and conservative from Kansas who died in 1981 leaving no children did have a trustworthy friend who was and is a prominent philanthropist in his own right. The friend, industrialist Charles G.

Koch, Chairman of Koch Industries, the second largest privately held company in the United States according to Forbes magazine, shared his libertarian beliefs and was a generation younger. Some twenty years after Lambe's death, Koch, along with his wife and some business associates, continues to run Lambe's foundation." [Creating a Private Foundation, 2003]

Heartland Has Received \$632,000 From DonorsTrust. According to DonorsTrust tax documents, DonorsTrust gave the Heartland Institute a total of \$632,000 from 2007 to 2012 [DonorsTrust Form 990s via Conservative Transparency, accessed 6/17/15]

• The Kochs "Made Significant Contributions To Donors Trust Through Their Foundation," The Knowledge And Progress Fund, Including \$1.25 Million In 2007, \$1.25 Million In 2008, And \$2 Million In 2010. According to an interview with sociologist Robert Brulle for PBS Frontline, "We do know that the Koch brothers have made significant contributions to Donors Trust through their foundation called the Knowledge and Progress Fund. They gave \$1.25 million in 2007, \$1.25 million in 2008, and then \$2 million in 2010 to Donors. We don't know where it went after it goes to Donors, because it's not necessarily a one-for-one giving." [PBS Frontline, 10/23/12]

Heartland Has Received \$15,610,544 From Donors Capital Fund. According to Donors Capital Fund tax documents, Donors Capital Fund gave the Heartland Institute a total of \$15,610,544 from 2005 to 2013. [Donors Capital Fund Form 990s via Conservative Transparency, accessed 6/17/15; Donors Capital Fund 2013 Form 990 via Foundation Center, accessed 11/7/14]

- Donors Capital Fund Donated \$1.68 Million To Heartland In 2013. According to the Donors Capital Fund 2013 IRS Form 990, Donors Capital Fund gave the Heartland Institute a \$1,680,000 grant. Donors Capital Fund 2013 Form 990 via Foundation Center, accessed 11/7/14
- Donors Capital Fund Is Associated With DonorsTrust, And Deals With Clients Contributing More Than \$1 Million. According to Donors Capital Fund's website, "Donors Capital Fund is an IRS-approved, 501(c)(3), 509(a)(3) supporting organization that is associated with DonorsTrust, a public charity and donor-advised fund formed to safeguard the charitable intent of donors who are dedicated to the ideals of limited government, personal responsibility, and free enterprise. As a rule, DonorsTrust refers clients to Donors Capital Fund if they expect to open donor-advised funds of over \$1,000,000. In turn, the Fund provides personalized philanthropic services and specialized asset management for all clients with accounts that carry balances of \$1,000,000 or more. All contributions to donor-advised funds held by Donors Capital Fund are tax deductible under Section 170 of the IRS Code." [DonorsCapitalFund.org, accessed 3/5/13]

KOCH NETWORK EXECS AND SCHOLARS CRITICIZED THE POPE'S INVOLVEMENT IN THE CLIMATE CHANGE DEBATE

Republican Energy Lobbyist Michael McKenna: "For The Real Churchgoers, This Is Going To Be An Indictment Of The Pope." According to the New York Times, "But Michael McKenna, a Republican energy lobbyist and political consultant who described himself as a conservative Catholic, pointed out that there was already a backlash by conservative Catholics against the pope's efforts on climate change and other progressive policies. 'For practicing conservative Catholics, the folks who sit in the pews on Sunday, this is not going to be an indictment of guys like [Marco] Rubio and Jeb [Bush],' Mr. McKenna said. 'Those guys have already made up their minds on climate change. For the real churchgoers, this is going to be an indictment of the pope." [New York Times, 6/16/15]

McKenna: "The Pope Is Selling A Line Of Latin American-Style Socialism... This Guy Is Not In Sync With The American Catholic Church." According to the New York Times, "This pope is selling a line of Latin American-style socialism,' he [Michael McKenna] continued. "This guy is not in sync with the American Catholic Church. Guys like Jeb [Bush] and [Marco] Rubio are more in line with the American Catholic Church than the pope." [New York Times, 6/16/15]

• Michael McKenna Was President Of MWR Strategies. According to a bio on the MWR Strategies website, "Mike McKenna is the President of MWR Strategies. Prior to this, he worked in senior positions in a variety of opinion research and communications companies." [MWRStrat.com, accessed 6/17/15]

Michael McKenna And MWR Strategies Lobbied On Behalf Of Koch Industries From 2008 Through The First Quarter Of 2015, For A Total Of \$580,600. According to the Senate Lobbying Disclosure Act Database, Lobbyist Michael

McKenna lobbied for firm MWR Strategies on behalf of Koch Industries every quarter from Third Quarter 2008 to First Quarter 2015, earning a total of \$580,600. [Senate Lobbying Disclosure Act Database, accessed 6/17/15]

- McKenna Lobbied The House, The Senate, And The Department Of Energy For Koch Industries On Low Carbon Fuel Standards And Climate Change. According to the Senate Lobbying Disclosure Act Database, Lobbyist Michael McKenna lobbied the House, the Senate, and the Department of Energy for firm MWR Strategies on behalf of client Koch Industries on LCFS and Climate Change During Q1 2010. [Senate Lobbying Disclosure Act Database, accessed 6/17/15]
- McKenna Lobbied The House And The Senate On "Financial Reform Legislation" And "Climate Change And Energy Legislation" For Koch Industries. According to the Senate Lobbying Disclosure Act Database, Lobbyist Michael McKenna lobbied the House and the Senate for firm MWR Strategies on behalf of client Koch Industries on "Climate Change and Energy legislation" and "Financial Reform legislation" during Q2-4 2010. [Senate Lobbying Disclosure Act Database, accessed 6/17/15]

Acton Institute Rome Office Director Kishore Jayabalan: The Pope's Infallibility Does Not Extend To His "Environmental Views." According to a letter from Kishore Jayabalan, director of the Acton Institute's Rome office, Isituto Acton, on the Acton Institute website, "As the leader of the world's largest religion, the pope's moral authority is second to none, which is not to say that everyone, even in the Catholic Church, agrees with what he says. It is not controversial or disrespectful to admit this fact or to say that the pope is often more admired than imitated or followed. I would further venture that this is especially the case when the pope addresses issues not concerning matters of faith and morals, i.e. where his teaching is not considered infallible by the Church. It is one kind of problem if a Catholic disagrees with papal teaching on the Trinity or abortion; that Catholic's eternal soul would be considered at risk and all efforts would need to be made to correct his erroneous beliefs. It is an altogether different kind of problem if a Catholic disagrees with the pope on his diplomatic efforts or environmental views. Everyone should be in favor of peace between nations and care for God's creation but we differ on the best ways to approach these worthy objectives. The Church wisely respects differences of opinion on such matters." [Kishore Jayabalan Letter, 1/7/15]

Jayabalan: The Pope Saying The First Draft Of His Encyclical Was Too Long And Technical "Were Encouraging Remarks For Climate-Change Skeptics Such As Me." According to a letter from Kishore Jayabalan, director of the acton Institute's Rome office, Isituto Acton, on the Acton Institute website, "In an interview on the plane trip from South Korea last August, the pope himself said that the first draft of the encyclical was both too long and too technical, which were encouraging remarks for climate-change skeptics such as me. Some of his aides, such as Cardinal Pietro Parolin and Bishop Marcelo Sanchez Sorondo, have been more outspoken about the need to fight climate change, while other observers are much less enthusiastic about papal forays into the area." [Kishore Jayabalan Letter, 1/7/15]

Competitive Enterprise Institute's Myron Ebell On The Pope's Upcoming Encyclical On Climate Change: "I Think He's Very Ill-Informed" And "Ill-Judged." According to an interview of the Competitive Enterprise Institute's Myron Ebell by Guardian correspondent Suzanne Goldenberg on the Pope's upcoming encyclical on climate change "I think he's very ill-informed and he's ill-judged to be doing this." [Guardian, 6/12/15]

• Ebell: "The So-Called Global Warming Consensus Was Not Based On Science, But Was A Political Consensus." According to an interview of Myron Ebell of the Competive Enterprise Institute on PBS Frontline, "MYRON EBELL, Competitive Enterprise Institute: Yes. And we did it because we believed that the consensus was phony. We believed that the so-called global warming consensus was not based on science, but was a political consensus, which included a number of scientists." [PBS Frontline, 10/23/12]

Cato Institute Senior Fellow Doug Bandow: Pope Francis's Encyclical Demonstrates A "Lack Of Openness To Dissenting Viewpoints, Which Is "Evident" In Its "Brief Discussion Of Climate Change." According to a blog post by Cato Institute senior fellow Doug Bandow for the Cato Institute's Cato At Liberty blog, "Despite the many well-documented reasons for questioning both the severity of environmental problems and wisdom of entrusting government with new powers, Laudato Si appears to doubt the legitimacy of opposing views. The document complains that 'Obstructionist attitudes, even on the part of believers, can range from denial of the problem to indifference, nonchalant resignation or blind confidence in technical solutions.' This lack of openness to dissenting viewpoints is evident in the encyclical's brief discussion of climate change." [Cato.org/blog, 6/25/15]

Bandow: The Encyclical "Underestimates The Power Of Market Forces To Promote Environmental Norms."

According to a Cato Institute blog post by Cato Institute senior fellow Doug Bandow, "Pope Francis' new encyclical, Laudato Si, advocates a new 'ecological spirituality.' Yet this challenging call is diminished by the document's tendency to devolve into leftish policy positions. The encyclical underestimates the power of market forces to promote environmental ends. There are serious environmental problems but Laudato Si presumes rather than proves crisis is the norm." [Cato.org/blog, 6/23/15]

• Bandow: "Most Environmental Problems Result From The Absence Of Markets." According to a blog post by Cato Institute senior fellow Doug Bandow for the Cato Institute's Cato AtLiberty blog, "Most environmental problems result from the absence of markets and property rights. For instance, since no one owns the great common pools of air and water, 'externalities' abound. When possible, government should create quasi-markets or apply market incentives. In contrast, where government acts as property manager, it typically performs badly. For example, at the behest of business interests, Washington subsidizes grazing and timbering on its lands, opening up areas which otherwise would not be developed." [Cato.org/blog, 6/25/15]

Bandow: "Nothing In Scripture Or Nature Tells Us How Much To Spend" On The Environment. According to a Cato Institute blog post by Cato Institute senior fellow Doug Bandow, "Pope Francis' new encyclical, *Laudato Si*, advocates a new 'ecological spirituality.' Yet this challenging call is diminished by the document's tendency to devolve into leftish policy positions. The encyclical underestimates the power of market forces to promote environmental ends. There are serious environmental problems but *Laudato Si* presumes rather than proves crisis is the norm. Moreover, nothing in Scripture or nature tells us how much to spend to clean up the air." [Cato.org/blog, 6/23/15]

Bandow: The Pope's Encyclical "Devolves Into A Policy Document Which Might Have Been Issued By The Democratic National Committee." According to a blog post by Cato Institute senior fellow Doug Bandow for the Acton Institute PowerBlog, "The Gospel should affect how we think, feel, and live. We should relate through it not only to people around us, but the entire environment. Yet this challenging papal call is diminished by *Laudato Si's* tendency to devolve into a policy document which might have been issued by the Democratic National Committee. It's not that the encyclical is invariably wrong, but it often ignores the complexity of policy and limitations of politics. Most seriously, it underestimates the power of market forces to promote environmental ends." [Doug Bandow – Acton.org/blog, 6/23/15]

Bandow: "Large-Scale Natural Disasters" Are "Not Occurring More Frequently" As The Encyclical Suggests. According to a blog post by Cato Institute senior fellow Doug Bandow for the Acton Institute PowerBlog, "Laudato Si presumes rather than proves crisis is the norm: 'we can see signs that things are now reaching a breaking point,' evident not only in 'large-scale natural disasters' (which actually are not occurring more frequently), but also 'social and even financial crises' (which have no obvious relation to the environment)." [Doug Bandow – Acton.org/blog, 6/23/15]

Director Of The Center For The Study Of Science At The Cato Institute Patrick Michaels: Pope Francis' Encyclical Recycles "Old, Tired, And Discredited Ideas." According to an opinion by Director of the Center for the Study of Science at the Cato Institute Patrick Michaels for the Daily Caller, "Pope Francis' environmental encyclical *Laudato Si*" is, in parts, passionately and beautifully written. And it really is about recycling — of old, tired, and discredited ideas." [Patrick Michaels – Daily Caller, 6/19/15]

Michaels: The Encyclical "Reads Like The Disproven Doomsday Predictions." According to an opinion by Director of the Center for the Study of Science at the Cato Institute Patrick Michaels for the Daily Caller, "Much of it reads like the disproven doomsday predictions that have been churned out since the early days of the environmental movement. In his 1968 classic, The Population Bomb, Paul Ehrlich wrote that by about 1983 India would be 'gone,' hundreds of millions would die in famines (caused in part by global cooling), and there would be human 'oblivion.' In their 1972 book The Limits to Growth, Dennis and Donella Meadows confidently predicted we would be out of oil, most food, and breathable air by 2000. It is against this historical backdrop that Pope Francis writes that 'doomsday predictions can no longer be met with irony or disdain." [Patrick Michaels – Daily Caller, 6/19/15]

• Michaels: "My Generation Has Lived Through Eight Environmental Apocalypses." According to an opinion by Director of the Center for the Study of Science at the Cato Institute Patrick Michaels for the Daily Caller, 'It is against this historical backdrop that Pope Francis writes that "doomsday predictions can no longer be met with irony or disdain.' What do you think? My generation has lived through eight environmental apocalypses, including the two cited above. We have good reasons for disdain." [Patrick Michaels – Daily Caller, 6/19/15]

Cato Institute Center For The Study Of Science Director Paul Knappenberger: The Pope's Climate Change Encyclical "Lays Too Much Blame On The West." According to Nature.com, "The notion that rich nations have a special duty to fight climate change does not sit well with Paul Knappenberger, who directs the Center for the Study of Science at the Cato Institute, a free-market think tank in Washington DC. He says that the encyclical lays too much blame on the West, arguing that access to technology, fertilizer and appropriate crop varieties has a bigger influence on food production in poor countries than climate change does. "There are plenty of more effective things you can do to help the world besides trying to change the climate,' Knappenberger says." [Nature.com, 6/16/15]

• Knappenberger: "There Are Plenty Of More Effective Things You Can Do To Help The World Besides Trying To Change The Climate." According to Nature.com, "He [Paul Knappenberger] says that the encyclical lays too much blame on the West, arguing that access to technology, fertilizer and appropriate crop varieties has a bigger influence on food production in poor countries than climate change does. "There are plenty of more effective things you can do to help the world besides trying to change the climate," Knappenberger says." [Nature.com, 6/16/15]

THE KOCH BROTHERS HAVE DOWNPLAYED, AND EVEN PRAISED, THE EFFECTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE

Charles Koch Downplayed The Impact Of CO2 And Global Warming, Citing Differences In Measurement Techniques As A Cause For Debate. According to a Washington Post interview with Charles Koch, "KOCH: I believe it's been warming some. There's a big debate on that, because it depends on whether you use satellite measurements, balloon, or you use ground ones that have been adjusted. But there has been warming. The CO2 goes up, the CO2 has probably contributed to that. But they say it's going to be catastrophic. There is no evidence to that." [Washington Post, 8/4/15]

• Koch Claimed That Global Warming Theories Are Based In "Conjecture, Ideology And Politics," And That Climate Models "Don't Work" Since They Aren't "Testable And Refutable." According to a Washington Post interview with Charles Koch, "They have these models that show it, but the models don't work ... To be scientific, it has to be testable and refutable. And so I mean, it has elements of science in it, and then of conjecture, ideology and politics." [Washington Post, 8/4/15]

Charles Koch Dismissed Current Scientific Thinking On Climate Change As "Politicized Science." According to a Washington Post interview with Charles Koch, "I spent my whole life studying science and the philosophy of science, and our whole company is committed to science. We have all sorts of scientific developments. But I want it to be real science, not politicized science." [Washington Post, 8/4/15]

New York Magazine: David Koch Said "He's Not Sure If Global Warming Is Caused By Human Activities," But He "Sees The Heating Up Of The Planet As Good News." According to New York Magazine: "Koch says he's not sure if global warming is caused by human activities, and at any rate, he sees the heating up of the planet as good news." [New York Magazine, 6/25/10]

David Koch Said Longer Growing Seasons Would Make Up for Trauma Caused by Migration Away from Coastlines, That "The Earth Will Be Able To Support Enormously More People Because A Far Greater Land Area Will Be Available To Produce Food." According to New York Magazine: "Lengthened growing seasons in the northern hemisphere, he says, will make up for any trauma caused by the slow migration of people away from disappearing coastlines. "The Earth will be able to support enormously more people because a far greater land area will be available to produce food," he says." [New York Magazine, 6/25/10]

THE KOCH NETWORK HAS A LONG HISTORY OF CLIMATE CHANGE DENIAL

Koch Industries Overtook Exxonmobil As The "Top Funder" Of The "Disinformation Campaign" Surrounding Climate Change, Having Spent "More Than \$48.5 Million From 1997 To 2010." According to Think Progress, "Over the years, fossil fuel company executives have funneled tens of millions of dollars into this disinformation campaign. The top funder was ExxonMobil for a long time. But the company was overtaken years ago by Koch Industries, run by billionaires Charles and David Koch, who spent more than \$48.5 million from 1997 to 2010 to fund disinformation." [Think Progress, 7/10/15]

Donors Trust And Donors Capital Fund Spent \$125 Million To Spread "Disinformation About Climate Science" And To Thwart Efforts To Fight Global Warming. According to the Guardian, "The secretive funders behind America's conservative movement directed around \$125m (£82m) over three years to groups spreading disinformation about climate science and committed to wrecking Barack Obama's climate change plan, according to an analysis of tax records. [...] The anonymous cash flow came from two secretive organisations – the Donors Trust and Donors Capital Fund – that have been called the 'Dark Money ATM' of the conservative movement." [The Guardian, 6/9/15]

Smithsonian Exhibit Which Claims That "Humans Will Continue To Adapt To Future Extreme Climate Change" Was Funded By A \$15 Million Grant From David Koch. According to ThinkProgress, "The Smithsonian has come under fire for its association with the Koch brothers and its Hall of Human Origins exhibit, funded by a \$15 million grant from David Koch. The exhibit centers on a relatively new hypothesis, based largely in speculation, that extreme climate change in the past made humans incredibly adaptable. It also claims that humans will continue to adapt to future extreme climate change, illustrating this idea with an interactive video that lets visitors create future humans that have adapted to warmer temperatures simply by growing taller or adding more sweat glands." [ThinkProgress.org, 6/15/15]

Acton Media Director Jay Richards: "Climate Goes Up And Down All The Time, Historically, Without Of Course, Us Adding Carbon Dioxide To The Atmosphere." According to an interview with Acton media director Jay Richards posted on the Acton Institute website, "The basis of the claim is that we know that carbon dioxide, C02 is a greenhouse gas and we know its in the atmosphere and we know that its gone up, the amount of it has gone up in the last 150 years or so. Know we're talking trace amounts, like 325 to 385 parts per million carbon dioxide, still because we know it traps heat and is a greenhouse gas the assumption is that the fact that its going up and that the temperature is going up suggests that that's the cause. Now of course correlation isn't causation and that's the problem, we know a lot of other possible causes for the warming, like the variation in the output of energy from the sun for instance. We also know that climate goes up and down all the time, historically, without of course, us adding carbon dioxide to the atmosphere. It's a thousand – uh, much warmer a thousand years ago than it is now for instance, during the so-called medieval warming period." [Acton.org, accessed 6/12/15]

Flint Hill Resources Senior Vice President Sheryl Corrigan: "Resources That Could Be Applied To More Pressing Local Needs – Such As Rebuilding Outdated Wastewater Treatment Plants – Have Been Hijacked To Support The Climate Drumbeat." According to an article written by Sheryl Corrigan, Senior vice president, Flint Hill Resources, EH&S on the Koch Industries website, "Because the incentives for all those involved in developing climate change policy are not aligned, getting the best data to our decision-makers hasn't been successful or sufficient. The consequences of this (not just for Koch, but society as a whole) are twofold. First, what used to be a robust discourse on how to further stewardship efforts for air, land and water quality has now been reduced to a single topic: climate. Second, resources that could be applied to more pressing local needs – such as rebuilding outdated wastewater treatment plants – have been hijacked to support the climate drumbeat." [KochInd.com, 5/1/13]

Competitive Enterprise Institute's Myron Ebell: "The So-Called Global Warming Consensus Was Not Based On Science, But Was A Political Consensus." According to an interview of Myron Ebell of the Competive Enterprise Institute on PBS Frontline, "MYRON EBELL, Competitive Enterprise Institute: Yes. And we did it because we believed that the consensus was phony. We believed that the so-called global warming consensus was not based on science, but was a political consensus, which included a number of scientists." [Climate of Doubt - PBS Frontline, 10/23/12]

Koch Industries' Discovery Newsletter: "Climate Extremists Are Trying To Shout Down Any And All Dissenters... On The Mistaken Assumption That 'The Science Is Settled." According to an article from Discovery Newsletter on the Koch Industries website, Rather than encouraging open and honest scientific enquiry and debate about the issue, climate extremists are trying to shout down any and all dissenters. All of this should be a warning flag for anyone proposing actions to respond to climate change on the mistaken assumption that 'the science is settled." [KochInd.com, 1/1/10]

Americans for Prosperity-Texas Director Peggy Venable: "The Scientific Establishment Has Dropped The Ball. Carbon Dioxide Is Not A Pollutant. On The Contrary It Makes Crops And Forests Grow Faster. We Exhale Carbon Dioxide." According to Venable: "The scientific establishment has dropped the ball. Carbon dioxide is not a pollutant. On the contrary it makes crops and forests grow faster. We exhale carbon dioxide." [Lone Star Report, 1/29/2009]

Koch Industries Executive Vice President Richard Fink: Programs To Address Global Warming Are The "Kneejerk Reaction" Of A "Relatively Small But Well-Connected Group Of Alarmists And Special Interests." According to Fink: "Programs and policies such as these have been the kneejerk reaction of politicians to a relatively small but well-connected group of alarmists and special interests." [Discovery Newsletter, April 2008]

Fair Pay

POPE FRANCIS AND OTHER PROMINENT CATHOLICS HAVE CALLED FOR FAIR PAY AND WORKER SAFETY AS A MATTER OF "HUMAN DIGNITY"

America Magazine: "Pope Francis Spoke About Societies That Put Company Profits Above Human Dignity Or Even Human Life" And Asked "What Point Have We Come To?" According America Magazine, "On the feast of Saint Joseph the Worker, the pope spoke about societies that put company profits above human dignity or even human life. 'What point have we come to?' he asked. He noted that Jesus was a worker and lamented companies that put much more attention to profits than the dignity of labor." [America Magazine, 11/30/13]

• Francis: "I Address A Strong Appeal That The Dignity And Safety Of The Worker Always Be Protected." According America Magazine, "Expounding on the theme of the dignity of work, Francis said: 'We do not get dignity from power or money or culture. We get dignity from work.' He noted: 'Work is fundamental to the dignity of the person. Work, to use an image, 'anoints' with dignity, fills us with dignity, makes us similar to God who has worked and still works, who always acts.' Those familiar with the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises will note that this theme of God working or laboring comes from the signal contemplation for attaining the love of God where Ignatius speaks of a God who labors in all things. He ended his homily with the admonition: 'I address a strong appeal that the dignity and safety of the worker always be protected.'" [America Magazine, 11/30/13]

Bishop Stephen Blair, Head Of The U.S. Bishops' Committee On Domestic Justice And Human Development, Told A Senate Hearing That A Just Wage Is "Critical For Workers" And Would Help The Economy. According to an editorial by managing editor Scott Alessi for the U.S. Catholic, "Today marked the 75th anniversary of the Fair Labor Standards Act, the law that first established a federal minimum wage. And a Senate committee that gathered for a hearing in honor of the occasion got a great lesson in Catholic teaching on labor and economics, courtesy of Bishop Stephen Blaire. Blaire, who heads the U.S. bishops' Committee on Domestic Justice and Human Development, made a strong case for protecting the rights and dignity of workers, calling on the teachings of several popes including Leo XIII, John Paul II, Benedict XVI, and of course Pope Francis. In his testimony, Blaire argued that a just wage--one that realistically allows a worker to support their family based on the current cost of living--is critical for workers and would be a positive first step in fixing the economy. 'Work should be a ladder out of poverty for families, it should not trap them in poverty,' said Blaire. 'Yet this is where we find ourselves--a growing number of families are working but do not make enough to live in dignity. It is a scandal that the richest country world has allowed over 23 million children in working poor families to become the norm." [Scott Alessi Editorial - U.S. Catholic, 6/25/13]

Blair: "It Is A Scandal That The Richest Country World Has Allowed Over 23 Million Children In Working Poor Families To Become The Norm." According to an editorial by managing editor Scott Alessi for the U.S. Catholic, "Today marked the 75th anniversary of the Fair Labor Standards Act, the law that first established a federal minimum wage. And a Senate committee that gathered for a hearing in honor of the occasion got a great lesson in Catholic teaching on labor and economics, courtesy of Bishop Stephen Blaire. Blaire, who heads the U.S. bishops' Committee on Domestic Justice and Human Development, made a strong case for protecting the rights and dignity of workers, calling on the teachings of several popes including Leo XIII, John Paul II, Benedict XVI, and of course Pope Francis. In his testimony, Blaire argued that a just wage--one that realistically allows a worker to support their family based on the current cost of living--is critical for workers and would be a positive first step in fixing the economy. Work should be a ladder out of poverty for families, it should not trap them in poverty,' said Blaire. 'Yet this is where we find ourselves--a growing number of families are working but do not make enough to live in dignity. It is a scandal that the richest country world has allowed over 23 million children in working poor families to become the norm." [Scott Alessi Editorial - U.S. Catholic, 6/25/13]

Francis: "Not Paying Fairly, Not Giving A Job Because You Are Only Looking At Balance Sheets, Only Looking At How To Make A Profit. That Goes Against God." According to Business Insider, "How many brothers and sisters find themselves in this situation!' he [Pope Francis] said, as protesters in May Day demonstrations around the world rallied against unfair work conditions and unemployment. 'Not paying fairly, not giving a job because you are only looking at balance sheets, only looking at how to make a profit. That goes against God!' the pope said in his strongly-worded address." [Business Insider, 5/1/13]

- Francis: "We Do Not Get Dignity From Power Or Money Or Culture, No! We Get Dignity From Work." According to Business Insider, "The Vatican has often been sharply critical of unregulated capitalism, particularly in recent years during the global financial crisis. 'We do not get dignity from power or money or culture, no! We get dignity from work,' he [Pope Francis] said, adding that many political and economic systems 'have made choices that mean exploiting people.'" [Business Insider, 5/1/13]
- In A 2013 Speech, Pope Francis Condemned "Selfish Profit." According to Business Insider, "Pope Francis on Wednesday condemned as 'slave labour' the conditions for hundreds of workers killed in a factory collapse in Bangladesh and urged political leaders to fight unemployment in a sweeping critique of 'selfish profit'. The pope said he had been particularly struck by a headline saying workers at the factory near Dhaka were being paid just 38 euros (\$50) a month." [Business Insider, 5/1/13]

THE KOCHS AND THEIR ORGANIZATIONS HAVE ATTACKED FAIR PAY FROM ALL SIDES

Americans For Prosperity Policy Analyst Eric Peterson: "Mandating Higher Overtime Pay Carries With It Serious Economic Risks." According to a blog post by Eric Peterson, a policy analyst for Americans for Prosperity, for The Hill, "While backers of Obama's proposal suggest his executive action will result in pay increases for 5 million workers, his own Labor Department (the agency charged with implementing the new rules) estimates that only about one-fifth that number will see any tangible benefit – and even that could be an overestimate. Moreover, mandating higher overtime pay carries with it serious economic risks." [Eric Peterson – The Hill, 7/15/15]

Peterson: The Potential Result Of The Overtime Rule "Will Be Cutbacks In Employee Schedules, Greater Pressure On Struggling Small Businesses, And Shrinking Paychecks For Some Of America's Most Vulnerable Workers." According to a blog post by Eric Peterson, a policy analyst for Americans for Prosperity, for The Hill, "In short, the potential result of Obama's latest overreach will be cutbacks in employee schedules, greater pressure on struggling small businesses, and shrinking paychecks for some of America's most vulnerable workers." [Eric Peterson – The Hill, 7/15/15]

AFP: "Higher Mandated Wages Means More Money Flowing Into Union Coffers. Thus, It's Hardly Shocking That Big Labor Has Made Raising The Minimum Wage A Top Priority Both Locally And Nationally." According to web post from Americans For Prosperity, "Unions benefit immensely from higher mandated minimum wages since negotiated union wages often use the minimum wage as a baseline. And higher mandated wages means more money flowing into union coffers. Thus, it's hardly shocking that Big Labor has made raising the minimum wage a top priority both locally and nationally." [AmericansForProsperity.org/article, 5/29/15]

AFP: "Mandating A High Minimum Wage Actually Prevents Individuals And Business Owners" From "Reaching An Agreement That Works Best For Them." According to web post from Americans For Prosperity, "At first glance, Mr. [Rusty] Hicks' statement appears to be more appropriate for The Onion than the generally fact-based LA Times. That's because mandating a high minimum wage actually prevents individuals and business owners for [sii] from reaching an agreement that works best for them. Whether that means initially being paid less while a worker develops new skills that pay off down the line, or more modest wages for increased flexibility or benefits." [AmericansForProsperity.org/article, 5/29/15]

Generation Opportunity: "A Mandatory Minimum Wage Increase Could Have Some Sobering, Unintended Consequences That Harm The Very People They Are Supposed To Benefit Most." According to a web post from Generation Opportunity, "Unfortunately, however, Seattle's mandated increase in minimum wage is causing businesses to close. It hits franchise locations especially hard because they're considered to be big businesses, even though each location may only employ a handful of people. It's validating the concern that a mandatory minimum wage increase could have some sobering, unintended consequences that harm the very people they are supposed to benefit most." [Generation Opportunity, 5/9/15]

Koch Brothers' "Top Political Strategist" Richard Fink Argued The Minimum Wage Leads To "Fascism." According to the Huffington Post, "At a political strategy summit hosted on June 16 by the conservative billionaires Charles and David Koch, Richard Fink, their top political strategist, told the private audience that when he sees someone 'on the street' he says, 'Get off your ass, and work hard like we did.' Fink's anecdote came during his presentation titled 'The Long-Term Strategy: Engaging the Middle Third,' which capped off a session of four speeches detailing the intellectual foundation

of Charles Koch's political ideology. [...] 'Psychology shows that is the main recruiting ground for totalitarianism, for fascism, for conformism, when people feel like they're victims,' said Fink. 'So the big danger of minimum wage isn't the fact that some people are being paid more than their value-added -- that's not great. It's not that it's hard to stay in business -- that's not great, either. But it's the 500,000 people that will not have a job because of minimum wage. He continued, 'We're taking these 500,000 people that would've had a job, and putting them unemployed, making dependence part of government programs, and destroying their opportunity for earned success. And so we see this is a very big part of recruitment in Germany in the '20s.'" [Huffington Post, 9/3/14]

• Fink: Minimum Wage Puts "500,000 People" Out Of A Job, "Making Dependence Part Of Government Programs...So We See This Is A Very Big Part Of Recruitment In Germany In The '20s." According to the Huffington Post, "[Richard] Fink's anecdote came during his presentation titled 'The Long-Term Strategy: Engaging the Middle Third,' which capped off a session of four speeches detailing the intellectual foundation of Charles Koch's political ideology. [...] But it's the 500,000 people that will not have a job because of minimum wage. He continued, 'We're taking these 500,000 people that would've had a job, and putting them unemployed, making dependence part of government programs, and destroying their opportunity for earned success. And so we see this is a very big part of recruitment in Germany in the '20s. If you look at the Third -- the rise and fall of the Third Reich, you can see that,' Fink said. 'And what happens is a fascist comes in and offers them an opportunity, finds the victim -- Jews or the West -- and offers them meaning for their life, OK?" [Huffington Post, 9/3/14]

National Catholic Reporter: "Many U.S. Catholics Cringed" When Catholic University Accepted A \$1 Million Contribution From The Koch Brothers, "Who Have Advocated Eliminating The Minimum Wage Altogether." According to National Catholic Reporter, "Fresher still on the mind, many U.S. Catholics cringed in the fall of 2013 when Catholic University's newly opened business school accepted a \$1 million contribution from the libertarian Koch brothers, who have advocated eliminating the minimum wage altogether (NCR, Feb. 28-March 13)." [National Catholic Reporter, 4/30/14]

Americans For Prosperity Urged The Senate To Vote No On A Minimum Wage Increase. According to a vote alert from Americans for Prosperity, "Dear Senators: On behalf of more than two million Americans for Prosperity activists in all 50 states, I write to urge you to vote NO on S. 2223, increasing the minimum wage to from \$7.25 to \$10.10. This is a misguided policy that will mean fewer jobs in this sluggish economy." [Americans for Prosperity Vote Alert, 4/29/14]

• AFP: "Raising The Minimum Wage Does More Harm Than Good." According to a "Legislative Alert" on Americans For Prosperity's website, "A minimum wage hike is simply an ineffective way to help Americans rise out of poverty. It only reaches half of those it is intended to help and not in a positive way. Increasing employment opportunity gives low-skilled workers the best chance of finding employment and climbing up the economic mobility ladder. Raising the minimum wage does more harm than good." [AmericansForProsperity.org, 12/19/13]

Charles Koch: Minimum Wage Is An "Obstacle" And "We've Got To Clear Those Out." According to the Wichita Eagle, "In his interview he [Charles Koch] emphasized several times that he believes his ideas on economics will help disadvantaged people. Government regulations – including the minimum wage law – tend to hold everyone back, he said. […] 'Anything that people with limited capital can do to raise themselves up, they keep throwing obstacles in their way. And so we've got to clear those out. Or the minimum wage. Or anything that reduces the mobility of labor." [Wichita Eagle, 7/9/13]

THE KOCH NETWORK HAS ALSO BEEN ACTIVE IN THE PUSH TO PASS RIGHT-TO-WORK LEGISLATION

The National Right To Work Committee "Has Received Significant Funding From The Conservative Billionaire Koch Brothers." According to the New York Times, "Greg Mourad, a spokesman for a lobbying organization called the National Right to Work Committee, which has received significant funding from the conservative billionaire Koch brothers, compared the experience of being made to pay union dues to being kidnapped and extorted." [New York Times, 6/14/15]

Fred Koch In A 1960 Pamphlet: "Labor Unions Have Long Been A Communist Goal. How Far They Have Been Penetrated By Communists I Have No Idea, But It Must Be Very Far Indeed." According to the Center for Media and Democracy's PR Watch, "Labor Unions have long been a communist goal. How far they have been penetrated by communists I have no idea, but it must be very far indeed,' Fred Koch writes in his 1960 pamphlet A Business Man Looks at

Communism. When unions are not busy plotting the overthrow of America, they conspire to have the 'worker do as little as possible for the money he receives. This practice alone,' Koch adds, 'can destroy our country.'" [PR Watch, $\frac{3}{3}$]

David Koch In 2012: "We're Helping" Scott Walker, "As We Should;" What He Is "Doing With The Public Unions In Wisconsin Is Critically Important. He's An Impressive Guy, And He's Very Courageous." According to Bloomberg Politics, "We're helping him, as we should,' David Koch told the *Palm Beach Post* in February 2012. What Scott Walker is doing with the public unions in Wisconsin is critically important. He's an impressive guy, and he's very courageous." [Bloomberg Politics, 2/17/15]

LIBRE Press Release Headline: "Right To Work' Laws Associated With Stronger Growth." [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, 2/9/15]

Freedom Partners Directed \$1 Million To The National Right To Work Committee. According to an opinion by Carl Deal and Tia Lessin in the Daily Beast, "This calculus may be why in 2012, Freedom Partners—a group that Politico dubbed the Koch's private bank—directed \$1 million to the National Right to Work Committee (NWRC). And why Republican legislators and governors, buoyed by Walker's success in kneecapping public sector unions, are intent on eliminating all unions, public and private sector alike. Backed by big money like AFP and other groups in the Koch political funding network, and relying on pre-fab 'right to work' legislation authored by the NRWC and the Koch-funded American Legislative Exchange Council, they have introduced or will soon introduce union-busting legislation in key battleground states: Ohio, Colorado, New Hampshire, New Mexico, Missouri, and Pennsylvania, as well as Wisconsin." [Carl Deal & Tia Lessin – The Daily Beast, 12/22/14]